

# **ACADEMIC PROGRAM REVIEW REPORT**

BACHELORS OF VOCATIONAL EDUCATION  
College of Continuing Education

Spring 2006

## **Review Team Members:**

Janet Hecsh, Teacher Education, (*team chair*)

Yvette Farmer, Criminal Justice

Carolyn Janes, Teacher Education

Yan Xiong, Accountancy

Paul Bott, Professional Studies, CSULB, (*external consultant*)

## **I. Program Introduction**

The Bachelor of Vocational Education Program (BVE) is located in the College of Continuing Education. The California State University, Sacramento (CSUS) Bachelor of Vocational Education (BVE) degree program has been in existence since 1992. The degree is housed in the Department of Special Education, Rehabilitation, and School Psychology, but is administered through the CSUS College of Continuing Education. The program is and has been offered in a self-support mode, that is, it neither receives nor uses campus general fund income. Dr. William Harris, the program's founder, has been the director from inception until 2005. The BVE degree is, by California standards, a relatively old degree, having been established in 1943 by legislative authority. The BVE degree or its successor is offered at the CSU campuses in Sacramento, Fresno, San Bernardino, Los Angeles, Long Beach, and San Diego. The Sacramento State program is the second largest in the state, enrolling an average of 25 to 30 new students each semester.

The BVE program requires that students have five to seven years of vocational/educational/business experience in a designated field and the equivalent of one-year teaching/training experience prior to graduation. Admission to Sacramento State is required for this program. Candidates must complete General Education and Graduation Requirements for Sacramento State and the Vocational Education major. Under the Swan Act, degree candidates can receive up to 40 semester units of elective credit for prior job, teaching and supervisory experience or training education, upon evaluation by the state commission. All coursework taken in the BVE major is counted as upper-division semester units. Students receive letter grades, A-F, for all courses. Students completing the teaching or supervision credentials will apply to the Sacramento County Office of Education. Students receiving the bachelor's degree will participate in graduation ceremonies and receive their degree from California State University, Sacramento. The Vocational Education major courses are offered on weekends.

This review is the first program review by campus or external reviewers, so there are no recommendations from previous reviews to follow, apart from a WASC review of a satellite program. There is evidence, however, that program administrators and faculty have responded to less formal reviews of the program by advisory committees over the years and have adapted curriculum or delivery methods to better serve the program's audiences, including students and employers. In fact, in the period between the review (February, 05) and the final draft of this

report, BVE faculty and the College of Continuing Education have moved ahead with a number of initiatives aimed at addressing many of the Recommendations outlined in this report.

### **Program History**

The current BVE program, established in 1994, began in 1972 as a regular session, state-supported Bachelor of Vocational Education (BVE) degree program authorized by the academic master plan for Sacramento State offered through the College of Education, Department of Special Education, Rehabilitation, and School Psychology. In 1982 it was integrated into a CSU Consortium as a Bachelor of Science in Vocational Education (BSVE) to deliver select undergraduate and graduate degree programs to a statewide audience. These programs were presented in a non-traditional schedule that accommodated the working adult professional student. Many of the CSU campuses functioned as satellite centers for these programs, which were centrally administered through the CSU Consortium. In addition to the BSVE, the CSU Consortium also offered a Master of Arts in Vocational Education (MAVE). During this time, the CSU Consortium Vocational Education Department was located at Sacramento State. As the principle program site, Sacramento State supported the BSVE by allowing its local campus facilities and faculty to be used as part-time Consortium resources. Of particular importance was the long-standing role of Dr. William Harris from the Department of Special Education, Rehabilitation and School Psychology. Dr. Harris, who served as the Faculty Liaison for BVE Program (1994-2005), was formerly the Director of Vocational Education for the CSU Consortium.

In 1986, the CSU Consortium was disbanded. At that point, the College of Continuing Education (then called the Office of Regional and Continuing Education) responded to the persevering need for vocational education teaching professionals by offering two external teaching credential programs: The Designated Subjects Adult/Vocational Education Teaching Credential and the Designated Subjects Supervision and Coordination Credential, both of which are approved by the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing (CCTC). Both of these programs are part of the course sequence leading to the current BVE program.

In 1992, the College of Education, Department of Special Education, Rehabilitation and School Psychology, and the College of Continuing Education began work on developing a Bachelor of Vocational Education (BVE). After two years, the program was approved and

offered for the first time in fall 1994. This is the first Self-Study/Program Review scheduled for this program.

\*\*\*\*\*

<b>Item Found</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>NA</b>
A. Undergraduate Program Mission and Goals	X		
B. Graduate Mission and Goals			X under development
C. General Education Mission and Goals	X		
D. Evidence of Changes Made Since Last Review	X (since WASC)		
E. Program Changing in Response to Discipline Changes			X (graduate program pending approval)

\*\*\*\*\*

**OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. The CSUS BVE program has made dramatic progress in standardizing and codifying practices developed over many years under the leadership of Dr. Harris and has been very responsive and proactive in addressing the WASC review’s Recommendations for program improvement.
2. The CSUS BVE program faculty and the leadership within the College of Continuing Education evidence strong support for the program and for program improvement and are moving forward with plans for a graduate program in Vocational Education.
3. The CSUS BVE program is well regarded by its students, its graduates, and the employers of the graduates. Numerous graduates commented that they had received promotions or job commendations that were directly related to participation in and completion of the BVE.
4. The BVE program recruits and serves students who may not otherwise seek higher learning and provides them with the opportunity to be successful in a non-traditional academic environment.
5. All faculty and staff members of the program demonstrate genuine concern for the students, especially of the differences adult learners bring to the program. Students are most appreciative of those efforts and attribute their success in the program to the level of support provided by faculty and staff who teach in and work for the College of Continuing Education.

6. The program is well run and efficient, and good use is made of the fees that students pay for participating in the program.
7. The classrooms in Napa Hall are first-rate and would be the envy of most faculty members in the CSU system campuses.

#### **OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. The program faculty are encouraged to consider developing and requiring the use of a standard syllabus format that would include at least: instructor contact information, the course description, a comprehensive list of student performance objectives (outcomes), specific evaluative criteria and their relationship and weight in the grading process, a detailed outline of course content, the program policies regarding absences, and a detailed calendar of events in the course (a timeline).
2. The program faculty is encouraged to consider developing a policy and process to insure that all instructors evaluate student achievement using a variety of assessment tools, such as quizzes, objective tests, term papers, oral presentations, homework, class participation, and research. In addition, it is recommended that no single assignment or assessment activity constitute more than 25 or 30% of the course grade. Further, it is recommended that the program faculty jointly develop or adopt (and use) scoring rubrics for such activities as the term papers, research, oral presentations, and class participation.
3. The BVE program faculty is encouraged to look more deeply into issues related to achievement in mathematics and writing and investigate and incorporate appropriate strategies to support students via mentoring, advising and/or tutoring, making use of existing support services at CSUS as well as investigating other options.
4. The program faculty is encouraged to re-examine the sequence of course taking to ensure that EDS 109 is the first class in the program.

5. The College is encouraged to address the challenges that students report experiencing in completing General Education courses either because of time constraints or real or perceived differences between BVE and traditional CSUS undergraduates. It is suggested that the College and General Education faculty engage in discussions regarding non-traditional students, the BVE program and the integration of BVE students into General Education courses.
6. Alternatively, the College may wish to explore the possibility of providing the required upper-division general education courses either in a live, off-campus location, or online. Students reported that the most difficult part of the program was the requirement that they come to campus and attend those courses at the times that were more conducive to fulltime students. By providing the upper-division general education courses at the same site where major courses are taken, the BVE program will truly become a seamless exercise for the students.
7. The College, together with program faculty, may want to consider conducting a thorough review of the program elements, especially if they consider further the implementation of a master's degree program. Such a review might reveal the possibilities of "double-numbering" some courses so non-BVE graduates could use some of the courses as electives in the graduate program.

**SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS NEEDED TO MEET STANDARDS:**

1. Review existing policies and practices related to Information Competency and establish a "stand alone" Information Competency assessment plan for the BVE
2. Review existing policies and practices related to reading and writing in the discipline and descriptions of reading and writing assignments and develop a set of goals, policies and practices for the BVE program
3. Review goals and outcomes and develop a matrix of courses in relation to learning expectations
4. Develop program outcomes and rubrics to assess student outcomes across the program
5. Use assessment data to inform course and program level decisions related to curriculum and instruction.

## **II. Academic Programs**

### **1. Learning Expectations**

	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>NA</b>
A. Learning Expectations for Undergraduates	X		
B. Learning Expectations for Graduates			X
C. Expectations Specified for Discipline	X		
D. Expectations for Reading and Writing in the Major	X		
E. Descriptions of Writing and Reading Assignments	X by course, not program		
F. Standards for Writing and Reading in Discipline	X by course, not program		
G. Plans for Development of Reading & Writing Skills	X		
H. Assessment Plans for Writing and Reading Skills		X in progress	
I. Computer/Information Competence		X embedded	
J. Expectations Clearly Communicated to Students	X		
K. Curriculum Structured to achieve Learning Expectations	X		
L. Justification for Units in Excess of 120			X
M. Matrix of Courses in Relation to Learning Expectations		X	
N. Teaching Strategies tied to Learning Expectations		X under development	
O. Involvement in Distance and Distributed Education	X		

### **OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. The BVE program recruits and serves students who may not otherwise seek higher learning and provides them with the opportunity to be successful in a non-traditional academic environment.
2. The BVE academic program is responsive to current research and needs within the field of Vocational Education and the academic program is reasonably rigorous and well structured.
3. The BVE program has responded to the WASC review's Recommendations in the area of writing and has adopted more focused attention to providing access to writing skill development for students reflecting "uneven writing skills."

### **OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. The program faculty is encouraged to re-examine the sequence of course taking to ensure that EDS 109 is the first class in the program.
2. The program might look more deeply into issues related to achievement in mathematics and writing and investigate and incorporate appropriate strategies to support students via mentoring, advising and/or tutoring, making use of existing support services at CSUS as well as investigating other options.

3. The College, together with program faculty, may want to consider conducting a thorough review of the academic program elements, especially if they consider further the implementation of a master's degree program. Such a review might reveal the possibilities of "double-numbering" some courses so non-BVE graduates could use some of the courses as electives in the graduate program.
4. Learning outcomes, reading and writing goals and descriptions of reading and writing assignments are described in terms of the courses resulting in a significant degree of repetition and overlap. It is suggested that reviewing these goals and practices would result in a small, concise set of goals, policies and practices to inform faculty and students.

**SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS NEEDED TO MEET STANDARDS:**

1. Review existing policies and practices related to Information Competency and establish a "Stand alone" Information Competency plan for the BVE.
2. Review existing policies and practices related to reading and writing in the discipline and descriptions of reading and writing assignments and develop a set of goals, policies and practices for the BVE program.
3. Review goals and outcomes and develop a matrix of courses in relation to learning expectations.

<b>2. Assessment</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>NA</b>
A. Detailed Description of Assessment Plan	X		
B. Assessment of Student Learning Outcomes			X not with consistency
C. Surveys of Graduating Seniors	X		
D. Surveys of Graduate Students	X		
E. Surveys of Alumni	X		
F. Assessment data (AD) analyzes effectiveness of program learning outcomes			X in progress
G. Assessment data analyzes effectiveness of University learning goals			X in progress
H. Assessment data analyzes writing and reading standards in Major			X in progress
I. Assessment data analyzes effectiveness of information competence standards			X in progress
J. Evidence of consistency across multiple sections of same course			X in progress
K. Evidence of planning for improved effectiveness of program.	X		

### **OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. The CSUS BVE program is well regarded by its students, its graduates, and the employers of the graduates. Numerous graduates commented that they had received promotions or job commendations that were directly related to participation in and completion of the BVE.
2. The program has taken a pro-active stance in responding to the WASC review in addressing information competency and reading and writing standards by developing policies and practices to collect, evaluate and respond to student outcome data.
3. The program has been recently restructured by the College of Continuing Education and that restructuring has resulted in a comprehensive approach to assessment and evaluation including course oversight of multiple sections, computer/information competence and reading and writing performance of BVE students.

### **OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. The program faculty should consider developing a policy and process to insure that all instructors evaluate student achievement using a variety of assessment tools, such as quizzes, objective tests, term papers, oral presentations, homework, class participation, and research. In addition, it is recommended that no single assignment or assessment activity constitute more than 25 or 30% of the course grade. Further, it is recommended that the program faculty jointly develop or adopt (and use) scoring rubrics for such activities as the term papers, research, oral presentations, and class participation.
2. Faculty is encouraged to use assessment data to analyze program effectiveness in meeting student learning goals, in assessing student outcomes in reading and writing and information competency.

### **SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS NEEDED TO MEET STANDARDS:**

1. Develop program outcomes and rubrics to assess student outcomes across the program
2. Use assessment data to inform course and program level decisions related to curriculum and instruction.

<b>3. General Education</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>NA</b>
A. Evidence exists that courses meet General Education criteria			X
B. Evidence exists that service courses meet departmental and programmatic needs			X
C. Evidence of consistency across multiple sections of G.E. courses			X

The BVE program does not offer General Education courses. Instead, the BVE students fulfill their nine units of upper-division General Education in residence as traditional, on-campus students. At off-campus locations where coming to campus is geographically prohibitive, upper-division General Education (UDGE) is delivered on-site via special session. UDGE course selection is based on what is best for the cohort. Once the GE areas needed are identified and the UDGE course possibilities have been selected, the academic departments are contacted and will recommend faculty to teach the courses. In almost all of the UDGE courses offered, a full-time faculty from the department is used.

**OVERALL COMMENDATIONS: NA**

**OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS: NA**

**SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS NEEDED TO MEET STANDARDS: NA**

<b>4. Diversity</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>NA</b>
A. Curriculum appropriately addresses increasing cultural diversity of CSUS students			x
B. Department accommodates differences in student preparation and access to opportunities			x
C. Department helps students gain effective knowledge of life in diverse society.			x

**OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. The BVE student body is probably the most culturally diverse in comparison to other programs. Recruiters work hard to ensure that the program has a wide appeal to many different students with varying backgrounds and experiences.

2. Course content is current and representative of the current workplace (in other words, that it reflects the cultural diversity of California’s workplace). Additionally, the program includes two courses that specifically address issues of diversity: EDS 104, “Teaching Diverse Persons in Vocational, Technical and Adult Education” and EDS 114, “Multicultural Vocational/Technical Education for a Pluralistic Society.”

**OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS: NA**

**SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS NEEDED TO MEET STANDARDS: NA**

<b>5. Students</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>NA</b>
A. Student profile	X		
B. Academic Support	X		
C. Professional Development	X		

**OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. BVE students receive significant attention throughout their tenure in the program resulting in a generally high degree of satisfaction in the program. The BVE faculty and staff are perceived as being interested and engaged in student progress and the program is seen as being attentive and responsive to the needs and characteristics of a non-traditional student learner.
2. Students and graduates report that the courses not only fulfill the learning objectives of the program, but that the skills and knowledge they gained in the classroom were almost all immediately useful in their life away from school – either their job or their home.
3. The BVE program and the CCE is responsive to student interest in professional development and has recently moved ahead with a Master’s Degree Program in Vocational Education

**OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS: NA**

**SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS NEEDED TO MEET STANDARDS: NA**

<b>6. Faculty</b>	<b>Y</b>	<b>N</b>	<b>NA</b>
D. Faculty Profile	X		
E. Faculty as Teachers	X		
F. Faculty as Scholars	X		

## **OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. The BVE full- and part-time faculty are fully engaged in the decision-making for the program and meet regularly to discuss the program, provide input, and participate in the processes of curriculum planning as well as overall planning including the development and implementation of the Master's Degree in Vocational Education.
2. The full-time faculty members engage in scholarly and creative activities appropriate to the subjects they teach and they publish in venues particular to their subject expertise.
3. The part-time faculty members are "engaged practitioners" and bring a high degree of expertise to the program in addition to their formal education, and all work in professional areas served by program graduates

## **OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. BVE Faculty and Staff continue to meet regularly to focus on the areas indicated as needing attention or augmentation and continue to build upon the collective decision making process that has been recently implemented to further strengthen the program.

## **SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS TO MEET STANDARDS: NA**

### **7. Space**

The BVE program is located within the College of Continuing Education in Napa Hall. The classrooms are equipped with the most recent technology including computers, LCD projectors and other appropriate technology for instruction. The Review Team echoed the external consultant's comment, "The classrooms in Napa Hall are first-rate and would be the envy of most faculty members in the CSU system campuses." BVE students have access to all campus facilities including the library, AIRC, and other support and instructional services. The Review Team was

impressed with the state-of-the-art facilities in Napa Hall and with the facilities at the Sacramento City Unified Skills Center.

**OVERALL COMMENDATIONS:**

1. The impressive facilities at Napa Hall provide BVE students with a 21<sup>st</sup> Century learning experience.

**OVERALL RECOMMENDATIONS:**

1. The BVE program and the College of Continuing Education are encouraged to continue in their efforts to assure high quality facilities in the satellite BVE programs to ensure that off campus cohorts of BVE students or individual courses take place in learning environments consistent with or equivalent to those experienced by the on campus cohorts.

**SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS TO MEET STANDARDS: NA**