



California State University, Sacramento
Academic Affairs

December 15, 2003

MEMORANDUM

TO: Rita Cameron Wedding, Coordinator
Women's Studies Program

FROM: Linda Buckley, Director *LB*
Curriculum Planning, Assessment, and Accreditation
Academic Affairs

SUBJECT: Academic Program Review

California State University, Sacramento
6000 J Street
Sacramento California 95819-6036
DEC 18 2003
Faculty 413 Senate Received

Enclosed is a copy of the responses from the Women's Studies Program to the recommendations from the Conditional Approval of the 2000 Academic Program Review. The CSUS Program Review Oversight Committee has received, considered, and approved the responses and revisions to this review. The response is, therefore, being forwarded to the Faculty Senate for full program approval. If approved, the Women's Studies Program will be scheduled for its next review in Fall 2006 with the program self-study conducted in AY 2005-2006.

On behalf of the Program Oversight Committee, I want to thank both of you and the Women's Studies faculty for their cooperation in completing this review.

CC: Alexander Gonzalez, President
Ric Brown, Vice President, Academic Affairs
Joe Sheley, Dean, College of Social Sciences and Interdisciplinary Studies
✓ Bob Buckley, Chair, Faculty Senate
Ben Amata, Interim Chair, Curriculum Policies Committee
Jeffery Brodd, Chair, Program Review Oversight Committee
Susan Ogilby, Chair, Program Review Team

Status of CSUS Women's Studies 2003
Note from the Coordinator

The Women's Studies Program Review was conducted in Spring 2000. The Program Review Report recommending a two-year conditional approval was issued in Spring 2001. This report was amended in 2001 extending the approval to three-years.

Having the status of "conditional approval" lifted and being granted full approval to operate until the next program review cycle would be determined according to the report by significant progress toward the recommendations of the Program Review Team (PRT). At the time the report was issued no one seemed to know what constitutes significant progress. Therefore the report contained within, *Response to Recommendations to the Program* (and supporting documents) demonstrate progress that surpasses most recommendations (particularly governance, curriculum and student development) and at least significant progress towards all others. In some cases we argue that some recommendations were satisfied even at the time the Program Review was conducted (#5, #6, #7, #8, #12) and for yet another (#14) we question the validity of the recommendation both in terms of the rationale behind it, because it contradicts their own recommendations, and because it contradicts the principles and practice of Women's Studies scholarship and mission.

It should be further noted that we were disappointed by the Program Review Team's decision to grant us a conditional approval considering that correcting many of the areas of concern were contingent upon obtaining faculty resources or caused by insufficient faculty resources (historic faculty shortfalls and the subsequent over-dependence on service and part-time faculty) which are not controlled by the Program. We were also troubled by the inaccuracy and in some cases the trivial nature of some of the recommendations. We felt that such recommendations were inappropriate for inclusion in a document that had the ability to place a "hold" on our status and that the program review process should be used to make recommendations that can lead to substantive programmatic improvements. Finally, we also feel that when academic units challenge the accuracy of the recommendations, there should be a protocol in place to facilitate such challenges, especially since so much is at stake.

We were told by some associated with the process that the "conditional approval" would guarantee that we would get the institutional support needed to hire. I believe that conditional approval further stigmatized the Program and that to use it as "leverage" for institutional support was certainly done at the expense of the Program. We were also told by one of the members of the PRT that they were not aware of the recommendation for conditional approval until the time of signing.

Several people who have been involved in the program review process have indicated that the process needs to be standardized to protect against gross

disparities in the evaluation of programs. I am please to hear that such changes have been made.

Despite these very serious concerns, in the spirit of the Program Review process we approached each recommendation with enthusiasm and with the full intention of building a better and stronger CSUS Women's Studies Program.

We wish to express our appreciation to Dean Sheley for supporting our Program and insuring that we received the institutional support that made this status report a true source of pride and accomplishment. We also thank Linda Buckley and Leah Vande Berg for their support and obvious commitment to the success of Women's Studies.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Rita', with a long, sweeping horizontal line extending to the right.

Rita Cameron Wedding Ph.D.
Coordinator, Women's Studies

RESPONSE TO RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE PROGRAM 2003

This report details the progress of the Women's Studies Program beginning fall 2001. Each item is a response to the Program Review Recommendations in the order in which they appear in the *Recommendations to the Program* section of the Program Review Report. Occasionally direct quotes from the Program Review Team's recommendation (typed in subscript) are inserted for clarification. Supporting Documents, numbered 1-15, are referred to throughout the text.

PROGRAM DEVELOPMENT

1. The Women's Studies Program must develop a mission statement.

(1. Mission Statement)

2. A five-year plan must be developed to direct the program towards fulfillment of its mission.

(2. Five-Year Plan)

CURRICULAR DEVELOPMENT/REVISION

The Women's Studies Program began the work of curriculum redesign as early as 2001. Our proposals, as reflected in (3. *New Faculty Hiring Request* and 4. *Update on Women's Studies Redesign*), became more concrete once the Program completed the hire of a full-time Women's Studies faculty. Since the appointment of the full-time faculty member in Fall '02 we have completed our short-term curriculum goals and established a time schedule and rationale for the total curricular revision.

3. The Women's Studies Program should revise its curriculum consistent with the newly developed mission statement.

The curriculum should be driven by programmatic goals that reflect the mission of the WSP

The inter-disciplinary and multi-disciplinary model which integrates Women's Studies courses into disciplines like English, Government, and Criminal Justice, to name a few, exposes students to our field often for the first time. We encourage course development from other departments that supports the missions of both the National Women's Studies Association as well as our own. Cross-listed and service courses benefit the departments in which they are offered because they address gender dynamics in their respective disciplines. These courses support the general education of all CSUS students and they give Women Studies special majors and minors the benefits of a truly inter-disciplinary approach to the study of women.

The interdisciplinary and multi-disciplinary approach, which recognizes the value of women's issues being taught across many disciplines, is intrinsic to our mission. The opportunity for Women's Studies majors to build upon Women's Studies core and required courses with electives particular to their academic and career interest is ideal.

Phase I of our curriculum review, devoted to the core curriculum included:

A. Renaming or reorganizing categories to better frame the existing course offerings and to more accurately reflect our mission statement. (5. *Program Change Proposal*)

Economic Globalization and Transnational Feminisms
Identities and Intersectionality
Politics and Social Movements
Humanities

B. Course descriptions or titles were modified to reflect contemporary scholarship for the following courses:

WOMS 121 Women of the Middle East
WOMS 145 Feminism and the Spirit
WOMS 147 Transnational Feminisms

C. Women's Studies 132 Society of Women was deleted. It is our plan to redesign this course.

D. In the category Identities and Intersectionality two new service courses have been added for cross-listing with Women's Studies. (6. *Program Change Proposal letter to Curriculum Committee*) These courses will allow us to offer specific courses on four major California race/ethnic groups of women. In addition to Black Women in America (ETHN 172) and La Mujer Chicana (ETHN 132) which are currently offered as service courses the following courses will be cross-listed with Women's Studies.

Identities and Intersectionality:

ETHN 118 Asian American Women
ETHN 151 Native American Women

One very important way that the CSUS Women's Studies Program has distinguished itself is through its focus on intersectionality. Our curriculum reflects our position that gender does not create a universal experience for all women and that the way gender is experienced depends upon how it intersects with other social structural forces such as race and social class. Thus, our core curriculum which studies women's experiences multi-culturally offers our students a strong and broad course of study.

E. In the categories of "Humanities" and "Society, Politics and Social Movements" the following two courses have been included because they are consistent with our mission statement and reflect current scholarship in the field of Women's Studies.

Humanities

PHIL 126 Philosophy of Feminism

Society, Politics and Social Movements

SOC 126 Sociology of Gender

F. The Program completed Area D Course Assessment Plans for WOMS 110, 115, 136, 137, 138, and 139. (7. *Letter from General Education Committee*)

G. The Program completed the Phase I (mission statement and learning objectives) of its Program Assessment Plan. (8. *Program Assessment Plan*)

...the program review team recommends that the WSP streamline the cross-listed electives available to the students through the elimination of some and temporary retirement of others. These

H. As we evaluate the future directions of the program we will be in a better position to determine our relationship to service course offerings. Phase II of our curriculum revision (AY 04-05) will include development of procedures and policies for the evaluation and approval of cross-listed and service courses. All cross-listed or service courses adopted prior to 2002 will be evaluated. We will call for the syllabi of all courses and develop evaluation criteria for determining the inclusion of courses in our curriculum. A mechanism will also be developed to review all new course change proposals to monitor for jurisdictional concerns. Women's Studies will continue to include service and cross-listed faculty in the deliberations of curriculum through service on our Faculty Advisory Committee. (Please see response #13 and (9. *Rationale for Women's Studies Major*)

I. Phase III. of the Women's Studies curriculum redesign will build upon previous considerations of a Women's Leadership Program. We are considering either a minor, concentration or certificate program in Women's Leadership. We will build upon our current strengths and in addition to our core courses (WOMS 110, 115, 180 and 137) we will include courses such as *Women in Contemporary Politics*, a leadership training course and an internship. The purpose of this program is to provide students with an "applied" approach to Women's Studies. We believe this program will be attractive to professionals who are seeking degrees. Many of these students would be interested in a program that is supportive of "resumers" returning students while offering an educational program that is stimulating, and develops practical skills in leadership training that can enhance their personal as well as their career objectives.

This program will be designed with input from business, community and political leaders (local and statewide elected officials) students and alumni. We plan to have this program in place by Fall '05.

We are pleased with curricular revisions as outlined in this report and we remain mindful of the issues of accessibility and “time to degree”. We are committed to all of our students both those who pursue the regular Women’s Studies curriculum as well as those who will be attracted to the Leadership Program. We have been very successful filling classes offered during evenings, and weekends. We will continue to develop strategies to make our scheduling patterns accessible to students who might otherwise not be available to attend college and to insure a course rotation that will result in a timely completion of their degree.

4. The Women’s Studies Program should offer WOMS 115 (Introduction to Women’s Studies) as a lower division course.

Course Change Proposal has been submitted to move WOMS 115 to lower division.
(Please see response 6.1 and 10. Course Change Proposal)

5. The Women’s Studies Program should develop a Theories and Methods course.

Our seminar in Feminist Theory is our theories and methods course. The course runs once a year and is required for both majors and minors. This course is taught by Michelle Matisons whose research expertise is feminist theories and methodologies. The following is the course description taken from her syllabus:

This course explores debates in contemporary feminist theory from the vantage points of various critical traditions: Marxism, psychoanalysis, post-structuralism, and anti-colonial theory. We begin by considering how Marxism’s systematic analysis of capitalism and class relations has influenced feminist analyses of multiple oppressions (gender, race, sexuality, nationality). We then link these ideas to another important area of feminist methodology—standpoint theory. Part three of the course considers the further shift towards the “subjective” found in psychoanalytic and post-structuralist feminist theories. Major concerns of the course include the following: the strengths and weaknesses of systems theory; the problems that accompany politicized identities or “standpoints”; the necessity of linking subjective and objective forms of analysis; and the challenges inherent to intersectional thinking.

STUDENT SERVICES

6. The Women's Studies Program should participate in established university procedures of informing students about minors, majors, programs, and careers.

Departmental status has been long sought after but the number of minors and special majors has not yet warranted this type of commitment by the university.

A. While the two prior Program Review Teams were supportive of the major and department status, this Program Review Team advised that such an effort occur only after we had increased the numbers of our special major and minors. We question why the standards for a major are different for Women's Studies than for other disciplines. Gerontology has relatively few majors, no full-time faculty yet it offers a major and has departmental status. Environmental Studies has at times been very small in both the number of majors and the size of its faculty. It's the institutional commitment of resources that has allowed this program to grow not just the sheer will of committed faculty or students who will enroll no matter what. Contrary to the position of the Program Review Team we believe our growth has been constrained by a structure which promotes institutional barriers as well as bias. The Program Review Team's criteria for a women's studies major places all of the burden for growth on the program ignoring the obvious and inherent material and perceptual disadvantages of the structure to which we've been bound for 32 years. It is time for the University to toss out the dangling carrot and recognize Women's Studies as a bonafide department. To this end, we are petitioning for major and departmental status. (9. *Rationale for Women's Studies Major*)

B. As indicated in our mission statement "*what makes Women's Studies such a dynamic field is the conviction that theoretical knowledge is best illuminated when connected to political projects and personal experience*". We are therefore committed to developing the social and intellectual lives of our students. The following four areas are essential to student access and to supporting the career, academic social and intellectual interests of our students.

- curricular revisions to increase accessibility to freshmen
- intersegmental, campus and community outreach
- student development
- research and scholarship

1. Curricular Revisions

The WSP should offer a lower division general education course.

Making WOMS 115 a lower division course will allow us to take advantage of new student orientation for first time freshmen. (10. *Course Change Proposal for WOMS 115*)

2. Intersegmental, Campus and Community Outreach

The Coordinator should organize visits with the community colleges.

- a. Fall 2001 Coordinator met with Sierra College administrator and Women's Studies faculty member to discuss articulation relationships for Sierra's new Women's Studies Program.
- b. Spring 2003 Coordinator met with Sierra faculty member to discuss the development of new multicultural course.
- c. Fall 2003 Coordinator met with Sierra College faculty to evaluate new Women's Studies course materials.
- d. Spring 2004 CSUS Women's Studies faculty scheduled to talk to Women's Studies class at Sierra College.

The WSP has not taken advantage of the mechanisms across campus to attract and inform students.

- e. In the past the new student orientation for first-time freshmen was not a very effective recruitment tool because all of our courses were upper division. With the lower division introduction course first time freshmen can enroll in a lower division Women's Studies course. Also, with a major we can more effectively compete for transfer students who have not as yet declared their major. In the AY 04-05 we will launch our first major recruitment campaign. We will work closely with all three Los Rios Community College campuses focusing on the Behavior and Social Sciences departments and specifically Women's Studies classes where available. We will also identify community venues and utilize and establish CSUS mechanisms for student recruitment.

The WSP should educate the advising center and other departments/programs about its minor and special major...

- f. The Coordinator served as a faculty advisor in the Academic Advising Center Spring 2002.

3. Student Development

- a. The WSSA sponsored meetings for Women's Studies majors and other interested students to discuss Women's Studies careers and Ph.D. programs, Spring '03.
- b. The Coordinator performed in two productions (Spring 2002 and Spring 2003) of the Vagina Monologues. This performance is a V-day event (global movement to stop violence against women and girls) sponsored by the Women's Resources Center.
- c. The Coordinator is working with various University entities and the WSSA to organize a CSUS Marathon team. This team, sponsored by the WSSA and Buffalo Chips Running Club (as a fundraiser for Women's Studies student development activities) will train for

the San Diego International Marathon June 2004. This marathon team is open to all CSUS students, staff, and faculty.

d. We have students and faculty members who serve on the Women's Herstory Month planning committee with the Women's Resource Center.

e. Café Amador is our new student lounge (converted workroom) and is used regularly by students and faculty members.

4. Research and Scholarship

Women's Studies Faculty are committed to research and scholarship and to making our students an integral part of our scholarship agenda.

a. We are currently writing a textbook on diversity and social justice issues for Kendall Hunt publishing company. The textbook will be available summer 2004. Women's Studies is working with two student research assistants. One research assistant position is partially funded by the Kendall Hunt Publishing Company.

b. We are applying for an ASI grant to fund a student magazine entitled *Damaged Goods*. This magazine will be edited by students and will contain articles on a variety of social justice issues. (*Please see response #13.D*)

c. Professor Matisons is on two Ethnic Studies Master's Thesis committees.

d. Women's Studies hosted the Annual SSIS Colloquium entitled *Teaching and the War on Terrorism*, spring 2003.

e. Other panels and talks during Fall 2002-Fall 2003:

 "Who Wants a War with Iraq?", fall 2002.

 "Transnational Feminist Activism: Historical Legacies and Contemporary Challenges,"
 spring 2003.

 Forum on Prisons and Colleges, spring 2003.

 Two forums on Proposition 54, spring 2003.

f. We are collaborating with the Women's Resource Center on a Feminist Writers workshop during Women's History Month (*Please see response #13.C*)

7. The WSP should institute an internship program.

Women's Studies facilitated the internships for three students in the 2002-03 academic year. Two students were placed at the California Commission on the Status of Women and one at Planned Parenthood. Approximately five students from Women's Studies Classes volunteered to conduct telephone surveys for the California Post-Secondary

Education Commission (CPEC)- contacting schools about their Title IX efforts. The surveys were conducted at the California Department of Education, giving students both exposure to CDE, experience in conducting telephone research and to the Title IX as a major public policy issue. Through the community networks and research interests of Women's Studies faculty we have been able to provide academic and career related experiences for our students. Over 10 Women's Studies students have been hired for full-time positions (some managerial) at Child Action by a part-time faculty member. In 2001 a Women's Studies student internship in the WRC turned into a full-time university position.

The WSP should initiate discussions with alumni and other interested parties to develop internships for the students.

8. The WSP should provide opportunities for alumni and students to come into contact with each other.

A. Women's Studies has held frequent events which allow students to come into contact with each other; some of these are very formal others just "get-togethers". Since spring of '02 we have had two student graduation parties, a faculty retirement party, a reception for Mrs. Gloria Gonzales and a lecture on the War in Iraq. These events were co-sponsored by the Women's Resources Center and they were attended by students, alumni and faculty. Other events, for example the "no recall party", are more informal and impromptu. There were several students and two alumni present.

B. In spring '04, the WSSA will publish *Damaged Goods* which will be made available to students and alumni. (*Please see response 13.D*) This publication will increase the visibility of the Program and the involvement of alumni.

C. In order to facilitate our outreach efforts, in Fall '04 we will update our alumni roster.

...alumni may have experience developing informational brochures or other forms of advertising.

E. Thanks to Dean Joe Sheley for providing the funds for the Women's Studies brochure. The brochure describes our curriculum, faculty interests, careers and student statements. We were also able to print posters, and post-cards.
(11. *Women's Studies Brochure*)

PROGRAM GOVERNANCE

9. The WSP should restructure its governance structure.

(Please see 9. *Rationale for Major and Department Restructuring* and 12. *Letter to Dean Sheley*)

10. The WSP should reevaluate the decision-making role part-time faculty members take in the governance of the program.

(Please see 9. *Rationale for Major and Department Restructuring* and 13. *Women's Studies Policies and Procedures & ARTP*)

11. The WSP should enlist new members to participate in its governing body.

Should the petition for major be approved this will change the responsibilities of the governing body. (9. *Rationale for Major and Department Restructuring*)

There are two new members currently serving on our RTP committee.

12. The Program should participate in more campus activities with the Woman's Resource Center.

A. We have always worked closely with the WRC.

At least one Women's Studies faculty has always served on the board or the planning committee for Women's History Month.

B. Professor Matisons has sat on the Women's History Month planning committee since she arrived in Fall 2002. Her picture appears on the homepage of the WRC website.

C. We co-sponsor events regularly and most recently held a reception for Mrs. Gloria Gonzales (October 2003)

13. The Program should undertake discussions with other departments/programs to investigate possible joint and expanded course/program offerings.

A. The Women's Studies faculty have met with faculty in Ethnic Studies, Philosophy, Public Policy, Gerontology, Sociology, Social Sciences and General Education to explore potential course development. Courses in Ethnic Studies, Sociology and Philosophy have been included as Women's Studies electives. (*Please see response # 3.E*)

B. The Coordinator met with the Chair of Public Policy in the Fall of 2002 to explore a joint concentration or certificate program. During Phase III of our curricular review as we develop our Women's Studies Leadership Program this relationship will be considered. One of the drawbacks for a field such as women's studies is that it is not an "applied" course of study. Women's Studies students develop a unique inter and multi-disciplinary education in the social, political and economic systems and the myriad ways they reproduce systems of stratification based on gender, race and class. A Women's Studies Public Policy Leadership concentration or credential could offer a more applied approach

to Women's Studies. (Please see response #3.I and 4. Update on Women Studies Redesign)

This outreach would give those departments an interest in the continuing success of the WSP. Additionally, these efforts could identify faculty willing to serve on the Administrative Council or willing to disseminate information about the WSP to their students.

C. Five tenured and probationary faculty sit on our Faculty Advisory Committee (FAC). We will host at least one event each academic year for faculty teaching service, cross-listed and core classes to increase our visibility on campus. This event might be in the form of a Feminist Lecture series and/or it may be in the form of a more social event such as a reception. The first event is scheduled as a feminist writer's panel and workshop which will include faculty, student and community writers. We have already begun preliminary planning for this Women's History Month event with Women's Resources.

D. In addition to this outreach the students will publish *Damaged Goods*, a magazine highlighting Women's Studies student and faculty research.

These types of outreach designed not to be labor intensive but effective will help us to develop and maintain a strong sense of collegiality and cooperation between our Program and other departments. Our outreach program will also support our effort to maintain a relationship with alumna and develop a stronger community profile.

14. The Program should initiate the establishment of a Commission on the Status of Women on the CSUS campus.

The Coordinator has a different understanding of the External Consultant's intentions with regard to a campus Commission on the Status of Women. The Coordinator understood the Consultant's recommendations to be based on the historic lack of support faculty women (in general) have experienced on university campuses. This resulted in Women's Studies becoming a hub for campus women's activism and advocacy. By redirecting non-academic activities to the commission Women's Studies would no longer be expected to fulfill this niche. CSUS Women's Studies is not the hub it may have once been and therefore we do not feel a need for such a commission. In deed even if we were in favor of it, the Coordinator is not of the impression that the External Consultant intended Women's Studies to initiate this endeavor. (14. Coordinator Response to External Consultant's Report)

...most women's studies programs arose out of political activist movements. However, these programs have evolved into respected academic programs whose primary foci are education and scholarship. Given the changed nature of women's studies programs, the activist aspects of women's studies is best undertaken by a separate campus-wide Commission on the Status of Women. The WSP is the logical initiator of such a Commission ...

We are confused by the double message embedded in this recommendation. We are at once told that we are the logical initiators of a campus-wide activist organization while at the same time told that activism should be undertaken elsewhere.

In general we respectfully disagree with our colleagues about the relationship of activism to Women's Studies. Programs like Women's Studies and Ethnic Studies which emerged from activist roots remain strong because they maintain an inextricable relationship between scholarship, education and community. It's ironic that Women's Studies and Ethnic Studies are sometimes criticized for their sustained involvement in activism while the university works to institutionalize the concept of "service learning" which by definition is "the application of theory to service". Women's Studies has historically linked theory to practice and that is a quality which should be emulated not abolished. *"What makes Women's Studies such a dynamic field is the conviction that theoretical knowledge is best illuminated when connected to political projects and personal experience."* (1. CSUS Women's Studies Mission Statement)

Summary of Commendations to the Program

1. The WSP is commended for its maintenance of course offerings in light of prolonged faculty leaves.
2. The WSP is commended for what appears to be an excellent relationship with its students.
3. The Program Coordinator is commended for her dedication and commitment to the WSP in the face of unusual challenges.

Summary of Recommendations to the Program

Program Development

1. The WSP must develop a mission statement.
2. A five-year plan must be developed to direct the program towards fulfillment of its mission.

Curriculum Development/Revision

3. The WSP should revise its curriculum consistent with the newly developed mission statement.
4. The WSP should offer WOMS 115 (Introduction to Women's Studies) as a lower division course.
5. The WSP should develop a Theories and Methods course.

Student Services

6. The WSP should participate in established university procedures of informing students about minors, majors, programs, and careers.
7. The WSP should institute an internship program.
8. The WSP should provide opportunities for alumni and students to come into contact with each other.

Program Governance

9. The WSP should restructure its governance structure

10. The WSP should reevaluate the decision-making role part-time faculty members take in the governance of the program.
11. The WSP should enlist new members to participate in its governing body.

Outreach

12. The Program should participate in more campus activities with the Woman's Resource Center.
13. The Program should undertake discussions with other departments/programs to investigate possible joint and expanded course/program offerings.
14. The Program should initiate the establishment of a Commission on the Status of Women on the CSUS campus.

Recommendations to the Dean of Social Sciences and Interdisciplinary Studies

15. Reassign the Program Coordinator from half time Ethnic Studies and half-time Women's Studies to full-time Women's Studies faculty status.
16. Provide 6 units of assigned time to the Coordinator to institute the changes recommended in this report.
17. Provide guidance to and support the Program Coordinator in exploring alternative governance structures.
18. Approve hiring of an additional full-time women's studies faculty position.
19. Provide a visiting scholar position for a period of two academic years to provide administrative and teaching support to the Program during the transition into its new mission.

Recommendation to the Academic Senate

20. The Review Team recommends the conditional approval of the Women's Studies Program for a period of three years.

3-5-01