# THE McNAIR SCHOLARS JOURNAL

**Volume 1**

1999-2001 Cohort

## Table of Contents

- Sexual Assault Among Adolescents and Young Adults Involving Date Rape Drugs: A Look at Their Beliefs
  - Sandra Little
  - Page 7

- The Privatization of America’s Prison System: Who’s Guarding the Gates?
  - Joel Rocha
  - Page 22

- An Investigation into the Public’s Understanding of Public Television and Their Desire for the Public Television Service to Continue: A Survey of Public Opinion
  - Sylvester Caraway, Jr.
  - Page 24

- Baseline Behavior Assessment of School Children
  - Robin Williams
  - Page 41

- Apologia and Damage Control: An Empirical Study of Benoit’s Theory of Image Restoration
  - Michelle Renee Dowling
  - Page 54
Foreword

The mission of the CSUS McNair Scholars Program is to prepare students for doctoral education. The program provides an excellent means for our students to heighten their education, and expand their view of the opportunities available to them. It will be exciting to see CSUS alumni out in the world, establishing a legacy, and making an impact by teaching and guiding lifelong educators. I understand the effort and commitment it takes to finish a doctorate degree, and it truly would have been helpful to have had the opportunity to participate in a program such as McNair during my education experience here at CSUS.

Our main mission is to recruit exceptional candidates and retain outstanding McNair Scholars. All of us who work on the program, and those who have been through it, know what an important bridge the McNair program is for advancing to the next educational level. Keep in mind that we are not merely a bridge but, for some, a light to the path of a promising future. For many of the students we are trying to reach, just earning a four-year degree is a dream realized. Now, with the assistance of the McNair Program, these students can visualize, and realize, even bigger dream. With the support and guidance of our faculty mentors, McNair scholars keep on their newfound paths. We hope to equip our students so that they may successfully transition into academia as teachers who make an impact on the dreams of tomorrow’s college and university students.

Chevelle Newsome, Ph.D.
Director
McNair Scholars Program
Sexual Assault Among Adolescents and Young Adults Involving Date Rape Drugs: A Look at Their Beliefs

*Sandra Little*

**Abstract**

Adolescents and young adults are four times more likely to be victims of sexual assault than any other age group in the United States. Yet, they are the most underrepresented group in research studies, with the greater focus being placed on college-age women. Studies show that a high percentage of women reported sexual victimization in their adolescent years and a belief in rape myths. This demonstrates the need to develop an intervention program to study 16- to 19-year olds; who are most at risk for sexual assault.

This study focuses on sexually coercive behaviors and the degree of acceptance of rape myths exhibited by answers to a pre- and post-survey. Sexually coercive attitudes are explored utilizing a series of situations, and compares responses given by females to those given by males. The target group is 15- to 19-year olds from a continuation high school. A variety of ethnic backgrounds are represented in this study. The results of this study clearly demonstrate that further work is needed in developing intervention programs. To be effective, the interventions must start prior to adolescence.

**Methods**

A MEDLINE and general search were utilized to locate current articles relating to sexual assault among adolescents, date rape and sexually coercive attitudes. All relevant articles were then systematically reviewed. This researcher created a pre- and post-survey instrument and developed an educational session, which was given to all seventy-one subjects.

**Results**

Seventy-one adolescents from the Thurgood Marshall Alternative School were surveyed. There were thirty-six females and thirty-five male subjects, the mean age being 16.39 with a median of 17; twenty-six students lived with both parents and twenty-six lived with the mother only; the remaining nineteen students had other living arrangements. This study showed similar risk factors as previous studies conducted on adolescents and young adults, such as dating at an earlier age, the location of the date.
and being more accepting of rape myths and violence towards women.

The pre-survey showed that females were more accepting of rape myths and violence towards women in certain situations.

One typical situation involved the question of how much money the male spent on the female. Another situation was when the female was wearing sexy clothes. A classic example of a rape myth believed by females is that when the female says "yes" to advances made by the male, then changes her mind and is raped, it is felt that the rape was deserved. Rape is viewed in the same manner for a female who visits a male's home, invites him over when her parents are away, or uses drugs/alcohol. The males in this survey justified their coercive behavior by the female's actions. For example, when she allowed him to spend money on her, 64 percent of males felt she owed him at least a kiss. When she invited him to her home when her parents were out, 63.8 percent felt that sexual intercourse was justified. When sexual assault was committed while the victim was under the influence of alcohol/drugs, both males and females viewed the victim as getting what he or she deserved.

Conclusions

In order to dispel rape myths and reduce violence toward women, longitudinal research designs are needed to increase our understanding of sexual assault among adolescents. Intervention programs must be developed to improve communication between females and males, reducing male sexually coercive behaviors and female acceptance of rape myths. Despite the many barriers faced in surveying adolescents, to reduce sexual assault we must conduct more and broader studies of this group.

Introduction

Sexual assault is a growing concern in the United States, especially among adolescents and young adults who are victimized four times more than the rest of the population. These assaults are usually perpetrated by acquaintances of the victims, not strangers. In a study conducted by V.I. Rickert, Psy.D., and C.M. Wiemann, Ph.D., they cited date or acquaintance rape to be as high as 68 percent for adolescents (16-19 years of age), and 27 percent for college-aged women (20-24 years of age). This review focuses on date rape among adolescents and young adults because young women are at highest risk for being sexually assaulted by someone with whom they are acquainted, particularly within the context of a romantic dating relationship, and are least at risk for assault by a stranger. In recent years, reports of date rape in conjunction with drug and alcohol use have increased at an alarming rate. The results of studies conducted by Abbey,
Ross, McDuffie, (1996), suggest that men perceive women who are drinking alcohol to be more sexually available and more likely to have sex with their partners than women who are not drinking. It has been proven that male predators use alcohol as a strategy against women. Abbey et. al. examined the role of alcohol and dating risk factors for sexual assault among a representative sample of female students attending a large urban university. These researchers found that frequent dating, higher numbers of sexual partners, misperception experiences, and alcohol consumption correctly identified those women who had reported dating violence.

The emerging trends in the use of illicit drugs characterized as “date rape” drugs, such as gamma-hydroxybutyrate (GHB) and flunitrazepam (rohypnol), must be examined in relationship to date and acquaintance rape and coercive sexual assault among adolescents and young adults. According to data released in the 22nd National Monitoring the Future Study, conducted by Johnston, O'Malley, Bachman, in 1996, the annual prevalence rates of illicit drug use continue to rise. Moreover, female adolescents across each category of use have slightly higher rates of illicit drug use than their male counterparts.

Date rape is a growing public health concern that requires a close look at the attitudes and beliefs that place adolescents and young adults at high risk for sexual assault. Vicary, Klingaman, Harkness, (1995), investigated risk factors associated with unwanted sexual activity in a sample of rural girls. They found that 15 percent of these young women reported experiencing date or acquaintance rape. Although family demographic variables were not significantly associated with the occurrence of unwanted sexual activity, women who had an earlier age of menarche and who were sexually active were significantly more likely to have had an unwanted sexual experience. However, the reason for the differences remains unclear.

Finally, it has also been suggested that sexual assault is a consequence of power disparity between dating partners. Therefore, the age difference between the couple may be an important risk factor. However, in a study among a college sample, Muehlenhard, Linton, (1987), compared recent and sexually aggressive dates with respect to the partners age difference and found no difference between those who were and were not sexually victimized. It is important to note that the focus on college students misses an important population as dating generally begins in high school. For many, adolescence is a time of experimentation with sexual attitudes and behaviors. This is the time when the power disparity of dating older, more experienced partners can lead to sexual victimization and the development.
of rape myths.

Several variables have been tested in relation to date rape. From the research, we know that alcohol has an impact on sexual assault. However, there are other drugs suspected of having an even greater impact. GHB and rohypnol are two well-known drugs associated with sexual assault on females and males. These drugs are especially dangerous to women who are unsuspectingly victimized. The perpetrator usually places the drug in the female’s drink when she is not watching. The following examples illustrate what can happen after the drugs are introduced into a female’s system.

**GHB and Rohypnol**

The only thing Hilary Janee Faris was known to have drunk that night was a couple of soda pops. Still, she came home from the dance club near her home town of La Porte, Texas, with nausea and a severe headache. Within 24-hours, the 17-year-old varsity volleyball player was dead. An autopsy showed no sign of alcohol or drugs. Then, alerted by Houston police of the dangers of a new club drug called gamma-hydroxybutyrate, or GHB, investigators decided to take a second look.

Sure enough, Faris’ tissues showed that she died of a GHB overdose.

“This kid was a role model type,” says La Porte lieutenant Carl Crisp.

“There’s nothing to indicate that she willingly took this drug.”

*(Time 9/30/96 p64)*

GHB is a central nervous system depressant. It can cause dizziness, confusion, and even death. It has become popular in clubs and has been used increasingly in cases of date rape, in which victims are rendered unconscious before being raped. GHB is usually slipped into the victim’s drink while she or he is not looking. It is easily home-brewed in basement chemistry labs. Instructions on how to make the drug can be found in libraries or on the Internet.

GHB and GBL are simple substances. GHB is usually made in liquid form but can also be made into a powder. It is made up of lye or drain cleaner mixed with GBL, or gamma butyrolactone, an industrial solvent used to strip floors. GBL converts into GHB once ingested. In its purest form, GHB is odorless and nearly tasteless. It can quickly depress the respiratory system when mixed with alcohol. The result is that not enough oxygen gets to the brain. When this occurs the victim experiences unconsciousness and memory loss. “A substance that knocks out the victim and leaves her with amnesia makes the perfect agent for date rape,” says Michael Ellis, director of the Southeast Texas Poison Center. *(Time*
Although GHB is the perfect agent for date rape, the Drug Enforcement Administration (DEA) believes the public is not fully aware of its dangers. Drawing from local and federal files about GHB, the DEA cites 3,500 cases of abuse, overdose, possession, and illegal manufacturing and trafficking since 1993. The DEA has counted 32 GHB deaths since 1995 and 22 sexual assaults since 1996 with GHB used as a sedative. (U.S. News and World Report, May 24, 1999 v126 i20 p73)

Rohypnol, a potent sedative-hypnotic drug, has gained popularity in the U.S. as a cheap means of intoxication. Rohypnol intoxication is characterized by the following: extreme disinhibition, severe memory loss, muscle relaxation, gastrointestinal disturbances, visual impairment, and slowing of psychomotor performance. ("Rohypnol Misuse in the U.S." Substance Use and Misuse. p723)

Rohypnol first appeared in the U.S. in the early 1990s and reports of misuse of the drug have increased steadily since 1993. (p724) One investigation estimated that 1.4 million pills are brought into the U.S. each year. Rohypnol is sold at a street price ranging from 50 cents to $8.00 per pill. (p724)

About the Victims

When a cop found her one night last February, she was crying and wandering through the frosty streets without a coat. Four players on the University of Arkansas basketball team had raped her. (U.S. News and World Report, Oct 7,1991 p34)

The lifetime prevalence of date or acquaintance rape ranges from 13 to 27 percent among college age women, and 20 to 68 percent among adolescents. (Medline Health star) Risk factors include date-specific behaviors, such as who initiated the date, who paid for the date, who drove, the location and the activity, as well as the use of alcohol or illicit drugs, such as GHB or rohypnol.

In a recent survey of 8,000 women, 55 percent of the respondents said they had experienced a rape, physical assault, or both at sometime in their lives. (Trial Feb, 1999 p106) Eighteen percent of the women said they had experienced a completed or attempted rape, and of those who had been raped, 54 percent said the rape occurred before they were 18 years old. Twenty-two percent were under 12 years of age and 32 percent were 12- to 17-years old. Women are at greater risk of partner violence than men, with 76 percent of the women polled being assaulted by a current or former husband, cohabitating partner or date.
Eight thousand men were also polled; 3 percent of whom reported that they had experienced a completed or attempted rape. Eight percent of those who had been raped said the violence was at the hands of a current or former spouse, cohabitating partner or date. Sixty percent had been raped by a stranger.

There is substantial literature documenting the fact that gender is a significant determinant of attitudes toward rape and sexual aggression. Research suggests that males are more likely to accept "rape myths" and support sexually coercive behavior than are females. (Acock & Ireland, 1983; Gerdes, Dammann, & Hellig, 1988; Giacopassi & Dull, 1986; Gilmartin-Zena, 1988; Margolin, Miller, & Moran, 1989) For example, Muehlenhard, Friedman, and Thomas (1985) found that male subjects rated rape as "more justifiable" when a female engaged in certain behaviors, such as going to a male's apartment instead of to a religious function. They also found that males classified as traditional, on the Attitudes Toward Women Scale, rate rape as more justifiable than do men classified as nontraditional.

Prevalence of Drugs Used in Sexual Assault

Cameron Welborn arrived at a Halloween party two years ago sporting a '70's-style' wig and a pair of perilously high platform shoes. But it wasn't the outlandish footwear that threw her dangerously off-balance that evening. Within 45 minutes of arriving at the party—and only halfway into a vodka and orange juice, Welborn suddenly collapsed. "I was in the middle of a sentence when I fell to the ground," she recalls. (People Weekly May 3, 1999 p133)

A field investigation was conducted in South Texas to examine the nature and consequences of the abuse of rohypnol. Sixty-six subjects identified as rohypnol users were asked about their use of alcohol and other drugs as well as their sexual behaviors. Almost all of the subjects used other drugs, primarily alcohol and marijuana. All had experienced adverse reactions, including amnesia, discoordination, automobile accidents, respiratory depression or arrest, and sexual assault. (Journal of Psychoactive Drugs 1996 April-June p183-189)

Legal Aspects

In 1996, after rohypnol had been dubbed the date rape drug, Congress adopted the Drug Induced Rape Prevention and Punishment Act, which increased prison terms and fines for criminals who use any combination of drugs to help commit violent crimes. (ADAW Oct.21, 1996.) As the number of drugs that have become associated with date-rape scenarios has
increased, federal and state lawmakers are showing more of an inclination to step in with tough-minded legislation. Various measures that have been adopted, or are being discussed, target both the distributors of the drug and those who use them to commit crimes.

In Massachusetts, for example, acting governor Paul Cellucci signed a law in August 1998, targeting all three of the most commonly used date-rape drugs. The law established a new category of crime: drug-induced kidnapping. United States Representative Sheila Jackson-Lee (D -Texas) introduced legislation that would make it easier to prosecute dealers who change the recipe for GHB so that the product no longer fits the drug's legal definition, but still produces the same effects in users.

The U.S. House of Representatives Judiciary Subcommittee on Crime held a hearing in July 1998 on controlled and uncontrolled substances that have been used to commit date rape in situations when a woman unwillingly takes the drug and is rendered incapacitated. Drugs commonly used in these scenarios have included rohypnol, ketamine hydrochloride (often called special K), and, most recently, GHB. Experts told members of the subcommittee that because GHB is a colorless, odorless substance that can be hidden in a drink, and because any trace of it can disappear from the bloodstream in 12 hours, law enforcement officials face a serious obstacle in trying to build a case against those who use the drug to commit crimes.

GHB and rohypnol play a major role in assisting some rapists in committing their violent crimes. Victims are subjected to amnesia, respiratory arrest, and death. Although there have been attempts at the state and federal levels to prevent the use and manufacturing of these drugs in the U.S., they continue to be used socially by adolescents and young adults at dance clubs, parties, and raves. Since the drug is odorless, tasteless, and disappears quickly from the bloodstream, steps must be taken to educate potential victims about the drug in the hope that education will lessen the possibility of rape.

**Purpose**

The study assesses the attitudes and behaviors of adolescents 15- to 19-years of age in order to identify sexually coercive attitudes. These factors will aid in the development of an intervention program.

**Research Question**

The research question for this study is: What factors should be included in an intervention program for at-risk students?
Research Design

The researcher used an experimental research design. A pre-survey was followed by an informational session, and concluded with a post-survey being given to the same group of adolescents. The experimental research design was appropriate for this study in the following ways. The pre-survey was an indicator of what the participants already knew and believed, the informational session increased knowledge, attempted to dispel myths about date rape, and allowed for some one-on-one interaction. The post-survey was a process for evaluating if the knowledge gained from the informational session altered any of the participants’ beliefs. The post-survey revealed that any change in attitudes, directly or indirectly, was related to the informational session. This researcher hypothesized that any change and/or inconsistencies would be areas to focus on when developing future intervention programs.

Variable Specification

The confounding variables in the study are the presence of the researcher and the possibility of unintentionally influencing responses to the survey research questions. Other variables are that subjects 1) may not be truthful on the pre- or post-survey; and 2) are trying to figure out what the researcher wants them to say and then saying it. Steps taken to minimize these confounding variables include 1) meeting with subjects and school administration prior to conducting the research to explain its purpose; and 2) assuring that subjects’ identities remain anonymous by having them draw random identifying numbers (unknown by the researcher) that they write on the survey forms. The researcher will stress the importance of being as truthful as possible when answering questions and, where appropriate, provide space on the surveys for additional comments.

Elements and Sampling Method

The sample consisted of 100 13- to 19-year old students attending summer school at Thurgood Marshall Alternative School. A total of four classes were held over three days in which 27 students were absent and two refused to participate, leaving a sample size of 71 students: 36 females and 35 males. Volunteers were assigned random numbers, which were placed on both the pre- and post-surveys. The numbers were unknown to the researcher and school administrators. Students were offered a $5.00 incentive fee for completing the surveys, which amounted to $355.00 for the 71 participants. Pizza and soda were served to all participants on the next school day, during their lunch hour, at a cost of $334.76.
Procedure

A telephone conference was held with Dr. Kathy Whiteside, vice principal of Thurgood Marshall Alternative School, to discuss the research project and gain permission to survey the students. I met with Dr. Whiteside in her office on July 26, 2000, to review the appropriateness of the survey questions for the student population. I was given access to the entire enrolled population of 100 students, and introduced to the faculty. Prior to holding my first class, I met with all of the teachers and instructed them on the importance of being neutral during the sessions.

I held four class sessions; each was conducted in the same manner. As I entered each class, the teacher introduced me as a research student from California State University, Sacramento, and requested that students follow my directions. I provided information about why I was there and the following instructions: two sets of surveys would be handed out -- one turned face up, the other face down. They will be completing the pre-survey first, followed by an interactive informational session and concluding with completing a post-survey upon my direction. I told them that this was a blind study, meaning that their identities would remain anonymous and there would be no questions on the survey that could be used to identify them. I expressed the importance of answering all questions as completely and truthfully as possible as to not bias the survey. A student from each class passed out the packets randomly throughout the classroom; each packet had a number assigned to it for the purposes of pairing up the pre- and post-surveys. The students were instructed not to discuss the surveys. If any questions arose, they could direct them to me by raising their hands.

As students completed their pre-survey, they were asked to hold them up after covering their assigned number. I checked to make sure every question had been answered. After collecting all surveys, I held an interactive informational session, in which the students participated only when called upon. For each session I used transparencies. The students granted permission for all responses to be recorded. After the informational session the students were asked to turn over and complete the post-survey, following my previous instructions. I reminded them that all subjects would receive $5.00 for thoroughly completing all research materials.

When the students had completed the post-survey I gathered all materials and held a drawing for some giveaways, which included a pizza party for the class.
Data Analysis

The survey was used to obtain demographic characteristics (e.g., sex, age, religious affiliation, gender, and who the subjects live with). Sex, race and religion were treated as dichotomous variables and were dummy coded.

Females made up 50.7 percent of the subjects and males made up 49.3 percent. Their ages ranged from 13- to 18-year olds, with a mean age of 16.39 and a median age of 17. The distribution of ages were: thirty-two 17-year olds, twenty-three 16-year olds, nine 15-year olds, one 13- and 14-year old each and five 18-year olds. African Americans made up 35.2 percent; Caucasians 8.5 percent; Mexicans 16.9 percent; and Laotian, Native American, Hmong, Mien, Phillipino and mixed nationalities represented 39.4 percent. Of all subjects, 45.1 percent had no religious affiliation while 29.5 percent were Protestant, 18.3 percent Catholic and 7.0 percent were Buddhist.

In terms of family background, an equal amount of subjects (26) lived in two-parent households, as did those living with only their mother as head of household, each group representing 36.6 percent. The remaining subjects (19) had a variety of living arrangements, including living with other relatives, friends, or in group or foster homes. This group made up the remaining 26.8 percent.

The questionnaire also included the following four items dealing with subjects’ voluntary and involuntary participation in various levels of sexual activity:

1. Did you ever kiss someone you didn’t want to? (Kiss)
2. Did you ever make out with someone when you didn’t want to? (Makeout)
3. Did you ever have sexual intercourse with someone when you didn’t want to? (Sex No)
4. Did you ever have sexual intercourse when you did want to? (Sex Yes)

For each of the four items, subjects were asked to choose from one of the following four responses: never, 1-2 times, 4-6 times, and more than 6 times. Items one through three, indicators of sexual activity in which subjects engaged without full consent, were combined into a scale (AgWill). The reliability coefficient for AgWill was .98.

Over half of the subjects reported that they are sexually active. One fourth reported that they have been sexually involved with another person when they did not really want to have sex. Females were more likely to have been involuntarily sexual (68 percent) than were males (57 percent). About one third of each group engaging in unwanted activity reported
having had sexual intercourse at least once when they did not want to have sex. The nature of this experience is most likely gender based, with females more likely to report coerced sexual activity, whereas males engage in sexual behavior as a result of peer group pressure. Overall, this variable is an indication of the number of youths who are becoming sexual active in a coercive environment.

The balance of the survey was designed to elicit the subjects' attitudes about the acceptability of sexual coercion under specific circumstances. Subjects were given a list of 17 situations and asked to indicate "what situation makes it okay for a guy to make a girl do any of the following things against her will?" The following activities were coded according to sexual intensity (i.e., 6 = none, 1 = kiss, 2 = makeout, 3 = touch above the waist, 4 = touch below the waist, and 5 = sexual intercourse):

1. He spent $20-$40 on her.
2. He spent more than $40 on her.
3. He is so turned on he feels he can't stop.
4. She has done this with other guys.
5. She gets him sexually excited.
6. She is wearing "sexy" clothes.
7. She says yes, then changes her mind.
8. She says no but does not push him away.
9. She says no and tries to stop him by pushing or hitting him.
10. She goes to his house when his parents aren't home.
11. She invites him into her house when her parents aren't home.
12. She is drunk/stoned/high.
13. He is drunk/stoned/high.
14. She has done this with him before.
15. They have dated a long time.
16. They are engaged.
17. They are married.

After an initial examination of these 17 items, the following five scales were created using 15 of the items, leaving two as originally coded:

1. Amount of money he spent on her (Money): Items one and two.
2. Extent to which her behavior was blamed (Blame): Items four through eight.
3. Opportunity for the sexual activity to take place (SexOppor): Items 11 and 12.
4. Use of drugs and/or alcohol (Drugs): Items 13 and 14.
5. Level of sexual relationship (SexRelat): Items 14 through 17.
The reliability coefficients (Cronbach's alpha) for these five indexes were .83, .82, .92, .90, and .93 respectively. The two measures included in the analysis as originally coded were the following:

6. He is turned on and can't stop (TurnedOn): Item three.
7. She says no and pushes or hits him (No Attack): Item nine.

Frequencies were run on all 17 questions and divided into seven categories. Sexual coercion attitudes (SCAs) were run using one of the attitude measures as the dependent variable for the control group (those answering the survey prior to the educational session), and experimental group (those answering the survey after hearing the educational session). The analysis for this study consisted of an examination of the bivariate correlations and standardized coefficients for the demographic variables and sexual coercion attitudes before and after the educational session. This was followed by a comparison of the coercive behaviors demonstrated by female and male coefficients across the models developed, before and after the educational session, to determine the degree of change.

Data collected from the pre- and post survey, and information learned from informational sessions will be organized and classified into categories. This information will be entered into a research database and compared to findings in other studies. Differences in this underserved population will be noted for future studies and implementation of intervention programs.

Research Result

This study found no correlation among adolescents living with both parents or living with only their mothers for distinguishing among the types of sexually coercive behaviors they exhibit. Ethnicity had no significance on the outcome and no generalizations could be assumed for any group due to the wide variance. Although the study clearly demonstrates that sexually coercive behaviors cross all nationalities, it denotes a social problem and not one of ethnicity.

Females represent 50.7 percent and males 49.3 percent of the total population of subjects. Among this population males exhibit rape myths and sexually coercive behaviors 54.3 percent of the time when they spend money on a date compared to their female counterparts. At 47.2 percent, females tend to be less accepting of rape myths. Males find it justifiable to use coercion 60.6 percent of the time when women dress sexily compared to females who find it justifiable only 47.8 percent of the time. Males exhibit coercive behavior 65.7 percent of the time when the opportunity to have sex is present, and women are accepting of rape myths 46.3 percent of the time when they are in places they should not be.

When drugs and alcohol are used, males display coercive behaviors
62.9 percent of the time, and females are accepting of rape myths 43.1 percent of the time. Males (37.1 percent) and females (36.1 percent) are nearly equally accepting of the rape myth that if she says "no" but does not push the perpetrator away then she really means "yes." With females reporting 63.9 percent and males 62.9 percent, they were also about equal regarding the opinion that "no" should always mean "no."

The study showed that adolescent males exhibited sexually coercive behaviors that they felt were justifiable according to how much money they spent, the location of the date, the use of alcohol and drugs, and the behavior of their date or partner. This study found females to be accepting of rape myths especially when they perceived the assault to be the girl's fault. This study revealed a significant difference between male and female respondents on the post-survey. Females showed a slight decrease in the acceptance of rape myths after the informational session, whereas the male rate of acceptance of rape myths remained about the same. These rape myths have significant implications for designing an intervention for females, and by producing factors with which to target males for further exploration.

**Limitations**

The limitations of this study were the inability to: follow up with subjects and evaluate their beliefs and attitudes in another six months; to sample other groups of adolescents; and to conduct a series of educational sessions using a control group without any intervention.

**Implications**

Longitudinal research designs are needed to further our understanding of sexual violence among adolescents, and to identify effective ways to reduce it. Felton KM, Aiulio JJ, Geib A, state that sexual coercion among both male and female high school students is perceived as justifiable under certain dating conditions, despite evidence documenting the females' general unwillingness to accept rape myths and support sexually coercive behavior. Future research must concentrate on studying a variety of adolescent populations; identifying factors leading to sexual violence among this group; and developing an intervention program that addresses both males and female perspectives.
References

Ageton SS: Sexual Assault Among Adolescents. DC Health Lexington, MA, 1983

Davis TC, Peck GQ, Stornment JM: Acquaintance rape and the high school student. J Adolesc Health 1993; 14:220
Frinter MP, Robinon L. Acquaintance rape: the influence of alcohol, fraternity membership, and sports team membership. J Sex Educ Ther 1993; 19:272

Koss MP: Detecting the scope of rape: a review of prevalence research methods. Interpersonal Violence 1993; 8:198
Sexual Assault Among Adolescents and Young Adults Involving Date Rape Drugs

Marx BP, Van Wie V, Gross AM: Date rape risk factors: a review and methodological critique of the literature. Aggression and Violent Behavior 1996; 1:27

Mills CS, Granoff BJ: Date and acquaintance rape among a sample of college students. Sociol Work 1992; 37:504


Rickert V.L., Psy.D., Wiemann C.M., Ph.D: Date Rape Among Adolescents and Young Adults. Galveston, Texas, 1998

The Privatization of America's Prison System: Who'sGuarding the Gates?

Joel Rocha

Abstract

In the last few decades, the United States has experienced anexplosion in the population of prison and jail inmates. "Owing to massiveincreases in drug arrests and 'three strikes you're out' mandatory sentencinglaws, the number of people confined in local, state, and federal correctionalinstitutions has more than tripled since 1980, to over 1.6 million today"(Beiser 10). As a result our prisons and jails are filled to the maximum limit.Many county jails and state prisons have been under court order to closetheir doors to new admissions. Other prison sites have been running abovetheir capacity levels, some at 124 percent. For this reason, manypolitical leaders and correctional department directors have begun usingprivate prisons, hoping that they will be a permanent solution to thegrowing problem. According to Beiser, "The first private prison opened forbusiness in 1983, holding a mere 350 inmates. Today, almost 90,000inmates languish in over 100 for-profit lockups in the United States andPuerto Rico... Financial analysts predict that private prisons will house asmany as 400,000 by 2006"(10). Who is being hired to watch over thisexploding population? What hiring criterion is used to select theseindividuals? Are they as qualified as those officers working in government-run correctional facilities?

Subjects

My inquiry focuses on the criteria used by for-profit organizations tohire correctional officers. It is my hypothesis that correctional officers hiredby private prisons are not as qualified to perform and carry out their dutiesas their counterparts in the public sector.

Methodology

I will evaluate the hiring qualification criteria used by one for-profitcorrectional facility management company in comparison to those used bythe California Department of Corrections (CDC). I will contact eachorganization to request a printed employment packet, utilize informationfrom their Web sites, and speak with representatives of each organizationabout their hiring practices. The following qualifications will be examined:minimum educational requirements, history of drug use,
background investigation, physical exams or medical requirements, written exams, and prior experience.

**Data Analysis**

Data gathered was analyzed. My evaluation was limited because the for-profit organization that I identified for this study would not provide an employment packet and its representative directed me to speak with the CDC for further information. I utilized the limited information available on the company's Web site, but did not find it as thorough as the information provided by the CDC.

**Results/Findings**

The for-profit company's hiring qualifications for correctional officers exceed those of the CDC in one area: their candidates must have a higher level of prior experience and training to qualify for positions with the company. Many of their employees seem to be former employees of the CDC. The CDC considers applicants' experience but provides training to newly hired employees at its training academies.

**Limitations**

This study's primary limitation was that minimal hiring information was obtained about the for-profit organization. The CDC, however, provided a detailed employment packet and one of its representatives spoke briefly with this researcher. The difference in information sharing is likely a result of one of the organizations being private and the other public. Unlike their public counterparts, most private institutions are not required to share their information with the general public.

**Conclusion**

The data did not support my hypothesis. Further research is needed to complete a thorough investigation of the research question discussed here.
An Investigation into the Public's Understanding of Public Television and Their Desire for the Public Television Service to Continue: A Survey of Public Opinion

Sylvestor Caraway, Jr.

Abstract

The operating practices of, and the allocation of federal funding for the Corporation for Public Broadcasting (CPB) and the Public Broadcasting Service (PBS) have long been topics of criticism by Congress, media focus groups and the general public. These public service, nonprofit corporations have been criticized for being biased in social and political commentary programs, presenting false or inaccurate information in documentary programs, excluding public opinion in social issue forums, conducting illegal transactions with political and business entities, and squandering federal funding. Essentially, they have been accused of not being responsive to the public for whom they were created to serve.

In prior research conducted on the operations of CPB and PBS and the need for a public television broadcasting service, researchers have excluded the one essential element that these services were intended to serve: the general public. Although these researchers have produced evidence for the public to be concerned about, it is important for research to also ascertain the knowledge level of the public's understanding of PBS operations and their desire for continuing a public television service.

As prescribed by Congress and the Federal Communications Commission (FCC), broadcast airwaves are the property of the public. It is also true that public television is a public service that was created to serve the public's interests. Subsequently, when research is conducted concerning the public, it is only fair that they be represented in analyzing the future needs of maintaining a federally funded public television broadcasting service. As a public service, public television has many responsibilities. Accordingly, these responsibilities should be directed toward the general public for which public television was intended to serve. Taking into account the many accusations made against PBS, the question that arises is: "To whom is PBS actually responding?"

In the book "Public Broadcasting and the Public Trust," David Horowitz and Laurence Jarvie describe an incident that occurred between
Reed Irvine of Accuracy in Media (AIM), and Donald Ledwig, the president and chief executive officer of the Corporation for Public Broadcasting, "A postcard was sent to Ledwig from an old naval buddy stating, "What the hell is going on at your station?" It was a good question, and one that I [Irvine] put to Ledwig myself. Instead of responding directly, the head of the free world's largest government-funded television network rummaged through the clutter on his desk to retrieve a remote-control device. Holding it up, he said, "There are 80 channels at your fingertips. You don't have to watch this one." Is this the standard attitude of all public broadcasters, or is this just the opinion of one person within a bureaucratic system? This example, along with the many other harsh accusations made against CPB and PBS by Congress, media focus groups, and the general public, prompted this researcher's interest in this subject.

To fully understand the basis for this research it is necessary to review the history of how CPB and its affiliate, PBS, came into being, and the controversies surrounding them. These federally funded media entities were created to work together to serve the public's interests. Since their beginnings, Congress has repeatedly warned CPB and PBS to discontinue operating illegally or risk losing federal funding. Specifically, Congress stated that CPB and PBS were being unresponsive to the public that they were created to serve. Over the years, Congress has threatened to either decrease or discontinue its funding altogether due to biased programming, unfair operational practices and a total disregard for program content accuracy. Congressional legislators have also stated that public television stations could survive independently from federal funding by raising their own revenue from outside sources within their regions. Even with these congressional threats looming over its head, by the end of 1999 PBS had received an increase in federal funding from $250 million to $300 million, and is expected to receive an increase of $340 million by 2001.

Various media focus groups have also complained that they have been excluded from televised guest commentaries, debate and other social issue programs on public television. However, CPB and PBS contend that they are important media sources that serve the public's needs by providing alternative news, educational television, diverse and thorough documentaries, and "nonviolent" children's programming. PBS even describes itself with an attitude toward other commercial television networks with the slogan: "If PBS doesn't do it, who will?" Many cable networks come to mind that have, over the years, given PBS a run for its money with programming that often either matched or received higher
ratings than those of public television. Examples of these channels are CNN, Discovery, the History Channel, Arts and Entertainment, and Nickelodeon. Even though these networks have competed heavily with PBS by airing quality programs, they are not congressionally mandated to fulfill an obligation to the public: to "be a public service." In order to get a clearer picture of what has transpired with the public broadcasting service, it is necessary to understand how PBS has arrived at its present status.

Introduction

From its beginnings as an educational entity receiving only federal funding, PBS felt it could serve the public in a more efficient manner by becoming a nonprofit public service. As a nonprofit organization, PBS could seek additional public, private and corporate funding. President Lyndon B. Johnson established the PBS management group, called the Corporation for Public Broadcasting (CPB), in 1967. This came about primarily by PBS lobbying Congress for nonprofit status, and through pressure exerted by network executives who were concerned about more commercial advertising competition. President Johnson and his administration saw the CPB as a necessary entity that would assist PBS in providing alternative broadcasting, and serve as a conduit for PBS to receive federal funding as a nonprofit public service. Since their status change from educational to public service, CPB and PBS have been the objects of both congressional and public criticism. This criticism focused on operating methods, programming choices, biased programming views, inaccuracy of program content, and the exclusion of the general public as guests on social and political issue programs.

Research Purpose & Objectives

This research will gather vital data, based on the public's knowledge of PBS operations, to ascertain if the public wants to maintain a public television broadcast service. The purpose of this research is to obtain the opinions of a defined public regarding whether or not they want the public television service to continue. KVIE, Channel Six in Sacramento, California, will be the selected station for the study. Its broadcast area covers Sacramento, Stockton and Modesto, CA. As part of this study, a survey will be conducted using a questionnaire to collect the viewpoints of the defined public.

Rationale

The primary reason for conducting this research is to examine the general public's knowledge of public television's operating methods, and to
ascertain if the public wants to continue the public television service. In order to conduct the research properly, it is necessary to identify the respondents of the survey. They will be adults, ages 18 and over, who reside in the Sacramento, Stockton or Modesto California. It is also necessary to establish the criteria for the respondents in the survey. The respondents will be: 1) people who are viewers and members of public television; 2) people who are viewers of public television and are non-members; and 3) people who are community- and educationally-minded.

Community-minded is defined as individuals who actively participate in and support community programs, projects, and developments that enhance the growth and prosperity of their communities. Educationally-minded is defined as individuals who actively participate and support educational programs, projects, and developments that enhance the growth and prosperity of the people within their communities.

Along with identifying survey participants and defining the criteria required for respondent eligibility, it is important also to define the artifact being studied. The artifact being examined here is “public service.” The following definitions of the words “public” and “service” help establish the criteria and parameters used to conduct this research.

Public is: “1 of people as a whole, 2 for the use or benefit of all, 3 acting officially for the people 4 known by, open to, or available to most or all people” (475). Service is: “The occupation of a servant, 2 public employment, a breach of this, specifically, the armed forces, 3 work done for others, 4 any religious ceremony, 5 benefit, advantage, friendly help; also, professional aid” (Webster’s New World Dictionary, Warner Books paperback edition, 537).

Literature Review

In the book, Public Broadcasting and The Public Trust, many PBS station executives contend that operating as a federally funded public television service is difficult. According to these executives, these difficulties stem from addressing diverse audience demographics, meeting widely-varying public views and opinions, being a public institution directly responsible to the public, and being under the continual scrutiny of Congress, media, focus groups and the general public. These challenges are multiplied because each public television station is not only responsible to its prospective regional audience; they are also responsible to a larger national audience. Each public television station receives national programming from CPB and PBS headquarters and also develops local programming to reflect the demographics of its region. Funding is another issue that is unique to public television.

Federal funding received by PBS differs from one station to the next.
Public television stations in largely populated areas receive more funding than smaller rural area stations. Each station is responsible for raising additional funding through local area sponsors, and receives federal matching funds for its efforts. The stations generate additional funding by submitting proposals for federal and corporate grants and by conducting fund-raising drives to solicit memberships from local viewers. PBS has also turned to commercial sponsorship, evidenced by the increasing presence of commercials aired between programs.

The difficulties, funding or otherwise, that PBS contends it faces, do not absolve PBS of the accusations leveled against it. Some of the accusations are that PBS is showing bias in its airing of social and political commentary programs; becoming commercialized; presenting false or inaccurate information in documentary programs; excluding public opinion in social issue forums; conducting illegal transactions with political and business entities, and squandering federal funds. Since public television is a public service and is responsible for serving in the public's interest, it should expect to be scrutinized by Congress and the public. After all, the federal funding it receives results from taxes paid by the public. This paying public expects the public television service that it funds to be responsive to their needs.

This research will address three main areas of concern: identifying and discussing PBS' response to accusations made against it; discussing the perceptions that outsiders hold about public television; and examining how its advocates view the public television service.

What are the Accusations against CPB and PBS?

The following information is an overview of the accusations cited against CPB and PBS in this research paper. When available, the organizations' response to the accusations are also included.

Accusation 1: PBS shows biased in its social and political community programs.

PBS has been accused of strategically refusing to air programming that presents views different from those of its sponsors or that runs counter to current issues facing the country. In 1990, the Los Angeles Times ran an article about PBS' refusal to air a prize-winning documentary about alternative energy sources entitled Fire from the Sun. At the same time, the Persian Gulf War, which many critics contend was about savings the world's oil supply, was getting under way (Horowitz & Jarvik, 37). A PBS spokesperson, Barbara Goen of station KCET-Los Angeles, was quoted as saying "It could definitely be perceived that the funders have an interest in
the subject matter [of our programming].”

**Accusation 2: PBS has become more commercialized.**

PBS has adopted many of the advertising strategies of its commercial competitors. “If PBS is doing good while doing well, combining public service with entrepreneurship, as its 1998 annual report boasts, it is time that we take a careful look at what, indeed, they are doing (Hoynes, 2)”.
The line between commercial and public television began to blur when PBS started airing commercials, which are called “messages” by this network.

**Accusation 3: PBS presents slanted, false or inaccurate information in its documentaries.**

*Days of Rage*, a documentary about the Palestinian intifada, was set to air on station WNYC in the fall of 1989. After the station decided not to air the program, another PBS station, WNET, aired the documentary instead (Horowitz & Jarvik, 24, 25). The program drew critical press, public protests, and membership cancellations. WNET vice president, Bob Kotlowitz, was quoted as saying: “I thought the intifada program was a horror...And I wasn’t happy with having it on the air. But I’m happy that we made the decision to go with it” (Horowitz & Jarvik, 25). What responsibility does PBS have toward verifying the accuracy of programming content? Is it this network’s unique responsibility to present both sides of all issues that its programming addresses? These are the questions that PBS and the public that funds it need to examine.

**Accusation 4: PBS excludes public opinion in social and political programming.**

Because the general public in not usually represented in the social and political programming aired on PBS, their only opportunity to voice opinions comes after the fact. Viewers of public television are usually limited to voicing their opinions by letter, editorial comment or membership cancellation. Having the general public represented on every program of this type is unrealistic. However, people are beginning to demand that an earnest effort be made to include a public voice in some of public television’s programming. “People for Better TV, a broad coalition of concerned citizens and organizations, asked the FCC to begin an inquiry into...the public interest responsibilities of digital television broadcasters (Benton Foundation, 8).”
Accusation 5: CPB and PBS disobey laws and conduct illegal transactions.

The late 1990s found PBS affiliate station WGBH-Boston in a whirlwind of controversy. The station had given the Democratic National Committee (DNC) access to more than 32,000 names on its member list. WGBH was paid for the information and also received access to the DNC’s donor list (Sung, 1). When found out, the station admitted its mistake. Jeanne Hopkins, WGBH vice-president of communications, was quoted as saying “We were in violation of our policy...We apologize for it. (Sung, 1).” This incident is a clear instance of a public entity overstepping its bounds. It is reports such as these that drive Congress to add amendments to the reauthorization bills for CPB and PBS. These amendments detail how the organizations are to go about proving that they are meeting their obligations to the public who they have pledged to serve (Horowitz & Jarvik, 251, 252).

Accusation 6: PBS squanders federal funding.

In the 1990s the CPB was tasked with meeting a congressional mandate consisting of six directives. The directives were: “(1) to review its efforts, if any, to meet these provisions in the past; (2) to solicit the views of the public as to whether its programs were, in fact, fair and balanced; (3) to review its national programming to see if the programming was balanced; (4) to take any necessary steps to achieve balance where imbalance was detected; (5) to spread the word of its activities and share its experience toward achieving balance throughout the system; and (6) to report annually to Congress summarizing its efforts pursuant to these directives (Horowitz & Jarvik, 244).” Critics contend that the CPB has yet to meet any of these directives, and has squandered $500,000, in an attempt to remedy an “accessibility” problem. That remedy was CPB’s “Open to the Public” campaign.

How do outsiders view public television?

This question will be answered in the “Research Results” section of this paper. The findings from a survey completed by a sample group of public television viewers will be discussed.

How do its advocates view public television?

Current, an online “magazine” that reports information about CPB and PBS, along with comments from and about their executives and others, published the following quote — which appropriately sums up public television advocates’ view of public television.
An Investigation into the Public's Understanding of Public Television...

We are in the unique position to provide timeliness, context and follow-up. We are the only broadcasting entity whose mission is to serve the well-being of our constituency...We have a niche a mile wide, an opportunity in current media environs that is rich with promise. To give up or diminish this truly unique strength would be terrible (Jack Willis, President and CEO of KTCA, Minneapolis, St. Paul, Missouri).

Problem Statement
The purpose of this research is to compile data from the sample group to determine if, based on their knowledge of PBS operations, they want the public broadcast television service to continue. The survey instrument used in this research asks respondents to consider in their responses the accusations levied against PBS and the growing availability of programming, once unique to PBS, on cable-based networks.

Method
This researcher will gather needed data by obtaining respondents for a questionnaire using a convenient sample method. Respondents will be sought in local area shopping malls in Sacramento, Stockton and Modesto, CA. The questionnaire will focus on the respondents' knowledge of PBS' operations, and measure the public's interest in maintaining a public television service. Since its inception, the PBS has been under scrutiny from Congress, media focus groups and the general public for numerous alleged violations. In addition to the accusations discussed earlier, PBS has been accused of operating outside of its regulations as established by Congress and the FCC. In response, PBS contends that it is meeting its public obligation to: provide balance and objectivity in its programming content; conduct business ventures properly; and contribute a valuable service to the communities served by its stations.

Research Design
The data for this research will be collected using a survey. This method was chosen because it directly reaches the intended target sample, and also provides direct responses for data analysis in support of the research question.

Participants
The initial sample will consist of 300 area residents (KVIE, Channel Six's local coverage are defined previously). KVIE has a membership base of 70,000, and claims a daily viewership of 750,000. Area residents consist of the following: people who view public television and are members of public television; people who view public television and who are non-members, and; people who have a sense of community and are
McNair Scholars Journal

educationally-minded. This sampling group is being used because it is the segment of the public who views KVIE's programming and is served by this PBS station. Participants will be given a research questionnaire to complete. Additional details are presented in the "Procedures" section that follows.

Instrumentation
Data for this study will be collected via a questionnaire that solicits the following information.

Section 1 – Demographic and Personal Data
The questionnaire begins by asking respondents to report their gender, age, race, political affiliation, cable, satellite or antenna service provider, frequency of PBS viewing, and favorite PBS programs.

Section 2 – Viewer History
Respondents will be asked whether or not they view PBS and contribute, view PBS and do not contribute, and if they are community and educationally-minded.

Section 3 – Satisfactory Areas
Respondents will be asked a series of questions related to their level of satisfaction with PBS programming, their frequency of program viewing; and whether the programs met their and their families expectations of what a public television broadcast service is supposed to provide. The respondents will also be asked to rate programming areas using a five-point rating scale ranging from 5—Very Satisfied to 1—Very Unsatisfied. The following questions will be asked: Is there balance and objectivity in documentary programs? Is there balance and objectivity in news programs? Is there balance and objectivity in social and political programs?

Section 4 – Problems Observed
Respondents will be asked a series of questions related to accusations made against PBS. The list of issues includes: program content balance and objectivity, exclusion of public opinion, biased news reporting, presenting false or inaccurate information, illegal operations and misuse of federal funds. The respondents will also be asked to rate each type of program area using a five-point rating scale ranging from 5—Very Satisfied to 1—Very Unsatisfied. Documentary, news, and social and political programs will be rated.

32
Section 5 – Concerns Addressed to PBS

Respondents will be asked questions about any correspondence they have sent to PBS regarding program content or concerns about business operations. Questions include: What concerns were voiced? How often are concerns expressed? What type of correspondence was sent? What type of correspondence was received from PBS, the response time, and attitude of PBS contact? Respondent's satisfaction with response? Did any change take place as a result of their inquiry?

Section 6 – Changes Desired

Respondents will be asked a series of questions concerning their personal opinions of what they would like to see changed with PBS. Areas listed are: business operations, public contributions, corporate sponsorship, commercialization, federal funding, documentary programs, news programs, social and political programs, children's programs and educational programs.

Section 7 – Restructuring Options

Regarding restructuring options, respondents will be asked about what changes they would recommend for PBS operations. Respondents will be asked to rate the following restructuring options using either Recommend or Not Recommend:

- privatization of PBS
- network commercial airwaves tax to pay for PBS
- PBS becomes a competitive commercial station
- establish a securities bond supported by the federal government
- totally dissolving PBS
- PBS remains a federally funded public service

Section 8 – Need for Public Television

Respondents will be asked questions about whether or not they see a need for a public television service. They will be asked to support their responses.

Section 9 – Open-Ended Question

Respondents will be asked an open-ended question that enables them to provide miscellaneous comments at the end of the questionnaire.

Procedure

During the months of July and August 2000, the previously identified respondents will be sought in a public area, such as a shopping mall. Individuals who are ages 18 and over and of different races and political
affiliations will be asked if they meet the established participant criteria of: 1) being viewers of public television who make contributions; 2) viewers of public television who do not make contributions; 3) being community- and educationally-minded. The respondent also need to meet the requirement of viewing public television on KVIE, Channel Six, whose broadcasting area is Sacramento, Stockton and Modesto, CA. The questionnaire will only be given to those who meet the established criteria.

Data Analysis

Demographics: Race and political affiliation will compute demographics results for the entire sample. These percentages will provide readers with an overview of the social and political demographics of the sample. Program satisfactory levels: Means and standard deviations will be computed separately by race and political affiliation. These variables will be measured on a five-point scale. The means variables will range from 1 to 5, with 5 representing ultimate satisfaction and 1 representing unsatisfaction toward program content. The differences between the means for different races and political affiliation will be tested for statistical significance using a probability level of .05 or less.

Desire to maintain a public television service: The variables of means and standard deviations will again be computed separately by race and political affiliation. These variables will also be measured on a five-point scale, ranging from 1 to 5. The score of 5 indicates a high desire for maintaining a public television service and a score of 1 indicates no desire. The differences between races and political affiliation will be tested for statistical significance using a probability level of .05 or less.

Research Results

The results of this research indicate that respondents’ opinions about the public television service break down, in part, around political affiliation. The majority of respondents were democrats. Respondents identifying themselves as democrats, with few exceptions, were completely satisfied with public television’s programming and operations. Respondents identifying themselves as republicans showed mild support. A small percentage either straddled the fence between somewhat liking the service or totally disliking it. Those who identified themselves as independents held more reservations about the public television’s programming, but overall, they supported what the public television service stands for. Respondents who identified their political affiliation as “Other” reported the same views as the independents. Regarding whether respondents want the public television service to continue, the survey results indicate overall
support by all political affiliations. This is probably due, in part, to the majority of respondents being democrats, which caused the survey to reflect their views more heavily.

The research results also show that a majority of the respondents do not make contributions to public television. As discussed previously, survey results indicate that the majority of respondents, regardless of political affiliation, want to the public television service to continue. Reform Party respondents are less supportive of maintaining a public television service than any other group represented in the survey.

The survey respondents were also categorized by race. Although the results show that mostly respondents identifying themselves as “White” responded to the questionnaire, the results still provide an accurate representation of the demographic area surveyed. Results also provided information about respondents’ level of financial contribution to the public television service in relation to their race or ethnicity. A large percentage of all the respondents do not contribute to the public television service. Most respondents also indicated that they are not members. Although the percentage of those contributing to the public television service is small, respondents, by race, indicate a very high desire to continue the public television service. Asian respondents showed no response to questions about not wanting the public television service to continue.

**Rating Program Content**

The respondents were asked to rate the program content of five categories of public television programming that air on their local public television station (KVIE, Channel Six). These program categories are children, documentary, social, political and news programs. The results, based on respondents’ race, follow.

**Children’s Programming**

Of all types of programming, children’s programming received the highest satisfaction rating from all respondents. The race category of “Other” indicated a high percentage of being somewhat unsatisfied with children’s programming. Hispanic, Native American, Black and a small percentage of White respondents gave children’s programming ratings of very unsatisfied or somewhat unsatisfied.

**Documentary Programming**

Another category measured by race was the respondents’ level of satisfaction with public television’s documentary programming. In all race groups, the majority of respondents reported being satisfied with this type of programming. Respondents identifying themselves as “Other” in the
race demographic reported being satisfied with documentary programming, at least 20 percent more than all other races responding to this question. All races reported moderate ratings of being somewhat satisfied and very satisfied. Only respondents identifying themselves as “Other” did not report scores in the somewhat satisfied or very satisfied options. Again, all races reported being somewhat unsatisfied with public television’s documentary programming, but the percentages were very low. For the very unsatisfied option, still even lower percentages were noted from only Black, Hispanic and White respondents.

Social Issue Programming
In measuring respondents’ opinions of public television’s social issue programming, all races reported high percentages of being satisfied and somewhat satisfied. The rating of very satisfied also received a high percentage of responses. Only the race category of “Other” did not select this option. The rating of somewhat unsatisfied received few responses. However, respondents in the race category of “Other” represent 10 percent of all those choosing this option. None of the respondents identifying themselves as “Asian” selected this option. The results indicate that Hispanics reported being very unsatisfied with social programming more than any other represented group. Those in the race category of “White” also registered a low percentage level of satisfaction with public television’s social issue programs.

Political Programming
In the measurement of satisfaction with political programming, all races were represented in the categories of satisfied and somewhat satisfied. All races responded with very high percentages in the satisfied category. Native Americans respondents selected this option at least 20 percent more than the other race groups represented. In the category of somewhat satisfied, the race category of “Other” reported being 20 percent more satisfied with political programming than any other group. With the exception of Native Americans and those classified as “Other,” all race groups registered moderately in the category of very satisfied. All race groups except for “Other” reported low percentages in the somewhat unsatisfied category. Those identifying themselves as “Other” reported being somewhat unsatisfied at least 25 percent more than any other group. In the category of being very unsatisfied with public television’s political programming, low percentages were reported by Blacks, Hispanics, Native Americans and Whites.
News Programming

Finally, research results regarding respondents' level of satisfaction with public television's news programming show that all race groups reported very high percentages in the satisfied category. Native Americans reported the highest percentage of satisfaction with this type of program. The numbers for the race categories of "Other" and "White" were close behind. In the category of somewhat satisfied, all races reported low percentages, with the exception of the race category of "Others" who did not respond at all. Moderate percentages were reported in the category of very satisfied. Native American respondents had no response to this option. Results indicate that in the category of very satisfied, Asians respondents reported being 10 percent more satisfied with public television's news programming than other groups. The "Other" race group registered a higher percentage in the somewhat unsatisfied option than did those in the Black, Hispanic or White groups. Native Americans reported a higher percentage of being very unsatisfied than did those identifying themselves as Black, Hispanic or White.

Discussion

This researcher found that, in the course of this study, one's political affiliation was a strong predictor of how one responded to the survey instrument. Measuring responses by political affiliation, the majority of democrats liked PBS and gave it very high ratings in the areas of program content, balance and objectivity. These respondents were also satisfied with PBS' ability to meet their expectations. It was also common to note that all democrats wanted the public television service to continue. Republican respondents gave lower ratings than did democrats in the areas of program content, balance and objectivity, and having their expectations met. This group reported little support for public television's operations. This said, republican respondents still overwhelmingly indicated a desire for the public television service to continue. Respondents identifying themselves as either independents or "Other" for political party affiliations gave moderate ratings to the areas evaluated. Although these two groups were very opinionated about wanting changes made within PBS, they too overwhelmingly indicated a desire to continue the public television service.

The race demographic, however, does not offer any predictability as to how one might respond. Regarding being contributors to public television, the majority of all race groups reported being non-contributors. Respondents in the race category of "Other" reported being non-contributors at a rate of 20 percent more than all other groups. Reviewing the data by race to determine if there were any significant differences
regarding respondents wanting the public television service to continue, this researcher found that all race groups wanted the service to continue despite reporting marginal ratings of PBS' programming and its ability to meet their expectations.

This researcher found that the general public seems confused by the methods used by public television programming or they do not understand how public television is supposed to function and reflect itself toward society. The public does not have an understanding of what PBS was created for, and therefore does not know the level of expectations they should have for a public service such as this. This research has shown that, even though they may have strong opinions about what is presented to them by television networks, the public still believes generally in fair play and equal opportunity. It seems that the public believes in giving the public television service an equal share of the airwaves, regardless of the cost they may incur directly or indirectly.

The significance of these findings is that they show, based on political affiliation and race, the public does not seem too concerned about the means by which public television is presented to them. They just want a service that they feel is a reflection of what they believe represents the American people, and provides something different from programming on other major networks. It also explains why, with very low public contributions, the public television service seems to lean more toward programming choices that reflect more of the corporate view then that of the public.

Limitations

The limitation of this research is that it did not measure the public television service's audience on a national scale. It also did not obtain an accurate sample of the total population demographics of the KVIE, Channel Six's broadcast area. Also, because more democrats were surveyed, the results leaned more favorably toward this group's viewpoint than that of the other respondents political affiliations. Time was another limiting factor for respondents taking the survey instrument. A more controlled environment is needed to conduct an extensive and critically-responsive survey. This was evident by the fact that the majority of the respondents rushed through the questionnaire just to receive the gift offered as incentive for completing the survey. The survey contained extensive questions and required more than a few minutes to complete, which makes it more suitable for completion in a controlled environment.

To obtain more representative results, the survey could be administered in a more controlled environment, using test groups identified
by race and political affiliation. Participants could be given an overview of the study's purpose and then view a few short segments of programs aired by PBS. This would assure the researcher of a higher level of response to questions regarding opinions about programming content and other issues included in the study. The controlled environment would also enable respondents to take more time to critically answer survey questions. This researcher recommends that further research be conducted in a more controlled environment with a number of respondents who accurately represents the race and political affiliations of KVIE, Six's viewership.

Implications

Although the initial research indicated that, overall, the public wants the public television service to continue, it also remains for further research to determine whether the public truly understands the accusations made against PBS. Additional research questions for further study are: Does the public understand what obligations the public television service has toward the public? Would fully understanding PBS' obligation cause the public to relinquish their strong overall support for the continuance of public television? Enlightened, would the public consider other methods for funding and operating the public television service? It would also be interesting for further research to examine why some people contribute to the public television service and others do not.
References


Baseline Behavior Assessment of School Children

Robin Williams

Abstract

Violent behaviors in the school setting detract from academic learning (Smith, Armijo, & Stowitschek, 1997). Behavioral problems in the school setting are predictive of school failure, delinquent behavior, substance abuse, and mental health problems.

Subjects

This research study gathered data on baseline behaviors of twenty-two seven- to twelve-year old students at a state-funded continuation school in Sacramento County, California. Students involved were in grades one through six. Twenty students were boys, and two were girls.

Methodology

The method used was a modified version of ethnography. Based on experience during clinical rotation at a similar school site, I developed an observation form to track behaviors observed in the classroom and on the playground. Case studies using field notes describing extreme behaviors will be presented.

Theory

The overall theory for this study was developed in accordance with the conceptual framework of the Reciprocal Adaptation Model (RAM) (Division of Nursing, CSU, Sacramento, 1999). According to the RAM, the violent behavior of one individual (student) affects every individual (student) in the environment (school).

Data Analysis

Data gathered was analyzed. Ranges of behaviors were reported and means were calculated for each behavior on the playground and in the classroom. Trends were identified from the behavioral frequencies.

Results/Findings

Major trends identified include the fact that significantly fewer behavior problems were observed on the playground than in the classroom.
Limitations

Limitations of the study include the fact that it was a small pilot study involving twenty-two children, of which only two were girls. Also, all students were enrolled in a state-funded continuation school, and are not representative of a traditional public school.

Recommendations

It would be interesting to repeat the study and include students from a traditional public school in a similar socioeconomic area. Also, it would be interesting to see if the results are the same in the winter months, and whether the weather influenced the findings.

Conclusion

Seven- to twelve-year old children in continuation school behave better on the playground as compared to in the classroom.

Introduction

Violent behaviors in the school setting detract from academic learning (Smith, Armijo, & Stowitschek, 1997). The psychosocial needs of violent children with emotional and behavioral difficulties are often not met by parents or school personnel. Behavioral problems in the school setting are predictive of school failure, delinquent behavior, substance abuse, and mental health problems. Intervening early and effectively with students who have behavioral problems is a priority (Bierman, 1997).

In order to intervene with students who have behavioral problems, the nature and frequency of the problems must first be identified. An ethnographic research project was designed to observe and record behaviors that impair school performance and social interaction. The information gathered is useful for school personnel and other researchers interested in completing prospective studies at a future date.

Literature Review

The Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System (1997) reports that 14.8 percent of students surveyed had been involved in at least one physical fight on school grounds. Forty-five percent of elementary schools reported one or more violent crimes (National Center for Educational Statistics). Also, 8.5 percent of students reported carrying a weapon to school, and 7.4 percent of students surveyed had been threatened on school grounds.

Violent behaviors are often learned in the home, community and school. It is not uncommon to observe violent behaviors as a result of emotional or behavioral difficulties. The current interventions for 6- to 11-
year old (latency age) children in the school setting who have emotional or behavioral difficulties and violent behaviors are often time-outs in a quiet room, placement in continuation school, suspension, expulsion, juvenile hall placement and even placement in a locked psychiatric hospital setting.

Apparently, these interventions are not effective for students with emotional and behavioral difficulties and violent behaviors. Recent news and media report that children are continuing to commit violent acts at surprisingly young ages, provide motivation for researchers to find a more effective method to treat children with behavioral problems. Therefore, baseline behaviors need to be collected for use in a school-based intervention that is intended to decrease violent and emotional behavior difficulties.

Many school-age children are threatened by violent acts each day at school. Many factors predispose a child to violent behaviors. Violence is generally defined as the threatened or actual use of physical force against a person or group that either results, or is likely to result, in injury or death (Mercy and Rosenberg, 1993).

Spivak, Prothrow-Smith and Hausman (1998) discuss the characteristics and contributing factors of violence and intentional injury in their article Dying Is No Accident. The article discusses factors such as family history of violence and low self-esteem leading to increased rates of violence. Additional factors include race issues, socioeconomic factors, gender expectations, age and psychosocial pressures associated with adolescence. The article also identifies individual factors such as personal, behavioral and spontaneous characteristics that raise concern.

The article has merit in identifying broad categories of characteristics of those who often commit violent acts. However, more discussion is needed regarding the more specific and direct influences that lead to violence in schools. In Spivak’s summary of the article, he states “Although there will be no easy answers or solutions to this problem, it is essential that support be developed for experimental efforts. The health (care) community cannot ignore this problem and can in fact make a real contribution to its resolution through prevention, treatment and research.”

The article A Review of Violence Statistics Among Children and Adolescents in the United States (1998), by Hennes, produces more contributing risk factors for violence. These risk factors are more specific and include the impact of exposure to violence on children; children witnessing violence in their home; violence in the schools and in the media; easy access to firearms; alcohol and drugs; and the proliferation of gang activity.
Statistics in this article reveal African American males age 15-19 as the population at the greatest risk for violence and homicide (cite). At 27.2 percent, homicide rates are shown to be the highest for this age group in the Pacific region of the United States (ibid.). In 1995, 1 in 12 students carried a firearm to school (ibid.).

Hennes meticulously details the incidence of violence and homicide in the African American and White youth in this article. It would have been of value to provide related statistics regarding Hispanic and Asian youths. Hennes concludes: "In recent years, the at-risk group of the perpetrators has shifted to a younger age."

Grunbaum, Basen-Enquist, and Pandey (1998) detail the prevalence of violent behaviors among Hispanic and non-Hispanic, White students. In this research study, 1,786 high school students completed the Youth Risk Behavior Survey (YRBS). The results revealed no significant ethnic differences in the prevalence of drinking alcohol, drug use, carrying a weapon and plan or attempt of suicide.

Results of the study show an association between substance abuse, acts of violence, fighting and/or carrying a weapon to school. The study successfully identifies a correlation between substance abuse and violent behaviors with the YRBS. An additional survey, the Risk of Eruptive Violence Scale, would have identified the students who act suddenly in an aggressive manner. This information could be used to identify students with mental health problems, in addition to assessing students with substance abuse problems.

Another research study that incorporates the use of the YRBS is Recent Trends in Violence-Related Behaviors among High School Students in the United States, by Brener, Simon, Krug, and Lowry (1997). The study addresses the psychosocial consequences of violent behaviors. The objective of the data compilation was to measure trends in nonfatal violent behavior among adolescents in the United States. The researchers concluded "further research should explore ... what types of interventions are most effective."

The Group for Advancement of Psychiatry, 1999, found that children exposed to violence within their own environment are more likely to become violent themselves. Risk factors identified in this study include lower socioeconomic status, parental psychopathology, substance abuse and difficult childhood temperament.

Marans, Brokowitz and Cohen (1998) profiled a development trajectory that leads to children becoming involved in violent crime. Risk factors identified in this study include poverty, parental neglect, physical
and sexual abuse, chaotic family situations, school failure and substance abuse.

Review of literature on the subject of violence and latency age school children yields a common theme: further research and intervention is needed to detect, treat and thereby prevent further violence. Researchers have identified a myriad of risk factors that can be identified in children to predict violent behaviors. However, little research had been conducted to determine if interventions in the school by a mental health team could prevent violent activities.

The conclusions made by other researchers reveal a strong need for additional research. Such research is possible with the information gathered in this research proposal. Violence in the schools is often the result of untreated emotional and behavioral difficulties (EBDs) in children (Cooper, 1999). EBDs include extreme withdrawal from social involvement, isolating oneself from peers, preoccupation with emotional concerns, and negative attention seeking behaviors (ibid.).

In the classroom setting, attention seeking behaviors often manifest as inappropriate talk, yelling or shouting in class, leaving one’s desk or walking in class when remaining seated is expected and other attempts to disrupt the classroom setting.

In the book, *Understanding and Supporting Children with Emotional and Behavioral Difficulties* (1999), edited by Paul Cooper, authors Jones and Jones discuss assessment of the emotionally and behaviorally difficult child. Authors detail use of assessment tools to identify learning difficulties, Attention Deficit/Hyperactivity Disorder (ADHD), language impairments, anxiety and other personal traits and depression. Also, assessment of parenting style and socioeconomic status are needed to help determine which interventions are necessary to decrease violent and emotional behavioral difficulties in school aged children. In order to determine if interventions are successful, baseline behaviors need to be assessed.

Children with EBDs often have poor social skills. The article, *Interpersonal Disabilities: Social Skill Deficits in Older Children and Adolescents*, by Coleman and Lindsay (1992), discusses characteristics and assessment of children with social skill deficits. Children with poor social skills are at risk for isolation and rejection, feelings that often lead to EBDs (Coleman and Lindsay, 1992). Developmental characteristics of children with poor social skills include learning disabilities, behavioral problems, low self-esteem and academic problems (ibid.). Emotional characteristics seen in children with poor social skills include anxiety, fear of rejection, loneliness, sadness, depression and isolation. Developmental and emotional characteristics are
often intensified in the child's home, with parents who model aggressive behavior, poor parenting skills, drug and alcohol abuse, absenteeism and neglectful behaviors.

Coleman and Lindsay suggest: "good social skills can be developed and can favorably influence other domains of function. A sensitive and comprehensive assessment and management plan is essential." Self-esteem can be defined as the feeling or belief an individual has pertaining to his or her own self-worth and competency (Brooks, 1992). Self-esteem can guide one's thoughts and actions, and is often measured by acceptance from peers (ibid.). Children with chronically low self-esteem often perform poorly in school. Self-Esteem During the School Years, an article by Robert Brooks (1992), recognizes the significance of self esteem in the school years. In discussing the manifestations of self-esteem, Brooks details counterproductive coping strategies that are often seen in children struggling with low self-esteem. The strategies are quitting, avoiding, cheating, regression or "clowning around", controlling, being aggressive or bullying, being passive-aggressive, denying, rationalizing and being impulsive (ibid.).

These characteristics are also seen in children with violent behaviors, suggesting that self-esteem plays an important role in violence (ibid.). Psychologist Nathaniel Branden remarked "Apart from problems of biological origin, I cannot think of a single psychological difficulty... that is not traceable to poor self-esteem."

William Carey writes in his article Temperament Issues in the School-aged Child (1992), that temperament plays an important role in behavioral problems seen in children. Issues of temperament are evident in school performance. Temperament can not only lead a child to behavioral difficulties, it often contributes to the severity of the problem. School involvement, teachers' attitudes toward children and peer relationships are effected by temperament difficulties. The most common temperament difficulty is Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder. Carey believes interventions, including referral to mental health clinician, are needed.

**Method**

Twenty-two students, ages seven to twelve participated in the research study. Twenty students were boys and two were girls. All students reside in low socioeconomic neighborhoods, and most live in very dysfunctional home settings. All students were enrolled in a continuation school located in Sacramento County, California for children in elementary grades one through seven.

The participants were chosen due to their referral to continuation
school because of violent and aggressive behaviors or excessive truancy. Violent and aggressive behaviors are defined as one or more of the following: suspension from school due to violent activities, admission to a psychiatric hospital following verbal threats to peers or teachers, and manifest anger resulting in parent-teacher meetings at the school of origin.

**Design and Methodology**

The method used in this study to gather data was a modified version of ethnography. Ethnography involves examining the patterned interactions and significant behaviors and communication styles of specific groups (Frey, Botan, Friedman, & Kreps, 1991). The goal of my research project was to discover what behaviors are common in a continuation school classroom and on its playground. Case studies and field notes describing extreme behaviors observed will be presented.

I assumed the role of observer-participant, and was visible in all research settings. An observer-participant informs a group that they are being studied, but remains as unobtrusive as possible while recording field notes.

A survey form, the Behavior Observation Survey (BOS), was developed to track the number of violent and aggressive behaviors. Based on experience from clinical rotations at a similar school site, this researcher designed the BOS specifically for children with violent, aggressive and emotional behavioral difficulties. The survey includes 38 behaviors to observe in the school settings. It survey also includes an area for additional comments.

I observed each child for specific behaviors in both the playground and classroom settings. The number of observed behaviors in each setting were recorded on the BOS. The BOS was completed during a one-hour observation of each student.

One question for this study is: What behaviors occur with children ages seven to twelve in a continuation/day school environment? Sub-questions are 1) What types of behavior problems are observed on the playground? and 2) What types of behavior problems are observed in the classroom?

**Data Analysis**

Ranges of behaviors were reported and means were calculated for each behavior on the playground and in the classroom (Figure 2). Additionally, field notes were presented when they clarified the meaning of a given behavior in a specific context.
Case Studies

The case studies that follow took place in two different settings: the classroom and playground.

Classroom

Destructive behaviors were seen most often in the classroom. Each of the two classrooms accommodates ten to twelve children, and has one teacher and one teacher-aide. Desks are strategically placed throughout the room to help prevent conflicts between students. A few of the students' behaviors improved when seated near the teacher's desk, or when in the role of "teacher's-helper."

Case Study of H.I.

H.I. is a ten-year old boy in fourth grade. H.I. appears to enjoy the role of "teacher's helper" in class. His facial expression of interest in classroom activities and upright posture in his desk suggest he feels important, needed and useful in this role. As a teacher's helper, H.I. collects and hands out assignments to the class. His behavior is mostly positive when he is kept busy, however he likes to be in charge and will tell other students to sit in their chairs, or stop talking. H.I. does not like to be questioned or confronted by other students, the teacher or the principal. He becomes verbally defensive, and will walk away from people, yell or cry if the questioning or confrontation continues. When H.I. was not the teacher's helper, he required a lot of one-on-one time with the teacher, and would often lose recess privileges. He wants to please his teacher, a young man who is easygoing and openly displays his interest and caring for his students. H.I. can listen well during open reading and concentrate for a short period of time doing written homework in a quiet environment.

Teachrs and staff used time-outs or loss of recess as a consequence of destructive behavior. There were significantly more time-outs (classroom-6, playground-1), and loss of recess (classroom-15, playground-0) in the classroom setting, indicating the classroom setting is more challenging for students with behavior problems.

Case study of N.O.

N.O. consistently has unproductive, frustrating days at school. He is easily distracted by the other students' behavior, and has difficulty concentrating on his written classwork. As a result, he becomes frustrated and raises his voice at other students and the teacher. He walks around the class when he should be seated and uses foul language. These behaviors earn him a time-out and usually loss of recess. This, in turn, enrages him so much that he looks like he could explode from frustration. He pounds his
fist on the desk, kicks the desk and his head actually shakes and his face turns red when he is very mad in the classroom. N.O. was very aware of me, he often kept his eye on me. He even pointed out the “bad” behaviors of another student to me.

When students act out by yelling inappropriately (classroom–10, playground–1), or raising their voices inappropriately (classroom–20, playground–1), teachers often respond with behavior correction (classroom–53, playground–8). Examples of behavior correction at John Muir include verbal encouragement to stop the problem behavior, verbal warning that a time-out will occur, refereing a situation between students, and redirection by having the student move to another area. Behavior correction by teachers and staff was often ignored by the students (classroom–22, playground–2).

One student observed, A.B., left an impression on me. Unlike other students, who could not seem to control their behavior, or who could be easily encouraged to act out, A.B. had the ability to control himself and the classroom. Most of the observed racial/derogatory comments directed at teacher/staff (classroom–4, playground–0), or at students (classroom–3, playground–0) were from A.B.

Case study of A.B.

A.B. is a 12-year old boy. A.B. consistently makes cruel, racial and derogatory statements directed toward his teacher, an African American woman. He watches to see her response to his statements, and will continue talking until she verbally responds to him. He manipulates other students in the class to get out of their seats, throw items across the room, talk when they should not be talking, etc. A.B. made no eye contact with me, and very little with his teacher. Unlike the other students at John Muir, A.B. rarely loses his temper in the classroom, reclining in his desk observing the mayhem he helped to create. A.B. completes only the schoolwork he wants to complete. His dress and body posture suggests gang activity. A.B. has a criminal record and has spent time in juvenile hall. He reminds me of a lion, toying with its injured and weak prey; enjoying the suffering it endures as it slowly and painfully dies.

Many students were not able to follow directions (classroom–25) or finish their assignment in class within the time allotted (classroom–27).

Case study of L.M.

L.M. has an attention span of less than three minutes. He behaves better in small groups of two to three students. L.M. appears to be a follower rather than a leader, and is easily encouraged by others to act out inappropriately in class. He is eager to please the other students with
classroom behavior that distracts the students from the teacher, such as talking out loud, coughing loudly, dropping books and making distracting body sounds. He often stares at the wall or the blackboard and does not complete his schoolwork. L.M. has difficulty following the directions given for in-class work. Either he forgets them or does not listen while they are given.

**Playground**

Major trends identified included the fact that significantly fewer behavior problems were observed on the playground as compared to in the classroom. Students are allowed four recess periods on the playground each day. Teachers, principal or campus security personnel supervise students on the playground. The playground consists of an asphalt surface large enough to allow play with two basketball hoops, and a grassy area to throw footballs or play kickball. Following is a description of behavior problems observed on the playground.

The most common behavior problem observed on the playground was an angry tone of voice or frustrated facial expression (playground—15, classroom—40). Use of foul language also occurred (playground—13, classroom—40). There were dramatically fewer occurrences of students requiring 1:1 with teacher/staff on the playground (playground—2, classroom—27) as compared with the classroom.

**Case Study of O.P.**

O.P. displayed many problem behaviors in the classroom, such as using foul language (5), throwing objects (1), kicking objects (1), yelling inappropriately (3) and raising voice in class (2). When on the playground, his behavior improved. O.P. has an attention span of about three minutes when in the classroom. But on the playground, he was able to play basketball for over fifteen minutes, using foul language only twice.

**Recommendations**

Because students involved in this pilot study behaved better on the playground than in the classroom, teachers would benefit from considering ways to incorporate more physical activity into lesson planning. Students received four twenty- to forty-minute recesses in a six-hour school day. This researcher suggests that shortening each recess to allow for five to six recesses in a school day may be beneficial. Additionally, allowing sufficient time for stretching or physical outlets between classroom activities might prove helpful in lowering the number of verbal and physical outbursts in the classroom. Also, most students benefited from one-on-one attention from their teachers and small group activities. The use of teacher-aides and
parent volunteers in the classroom would help improve student to teacher ratios. However, most of the children observed were in class only because the alternative to school was juvenile hall. They did not seem interested in classroom learning.

**Limitations**

Limitations of the study include the fact that it was a small, pilot study involving only 22 children. Additionally, I did not talk directly with the children as is common in ethnographic approaches, but conducted simple, unobtrusive observation of behaviors. Because participants were not randomly selected for inclusion in the study, but rather a convenience sample was used, the results are only applicable to children in a comparable continuation school in a similar community. Moreover, all but two of the children were boys, so the findings are not applicable to a school in which there are an equal number of boys and girls. It would be interesting to repeat the study and determine if the results are the same during the winter months, or whether the summer weather influenced the findings.

**Conclusion**

Findings from this study suggest seven- to twelve-year old students in continuation school settings would benefit from small group (two to three students) learning situations. And, student behavior improved as a result of positive one on one time with a trusted and respected teacher. Students observed also behaved better on the playground when compared to the classroom. Therefore, this study suggests that students with classroom behavior problems would benefit most from a small group learning situation, with one teacher for every three students.
References


Marans, Brokowitz & Cohen


52
Apologia and Damage Control: An Empirical Study of Benoit’s Theory of Image Restoration

Michelle Renee Dowling

Abstract
Though the rhetorical genre of apologia dates back thousands of years, much research has been conducted in recent years on the topic and new theories have developed. Most available research presents the analysis of organizations engaging in apologia or, as it is often referred to, image restoration. William L. Benoit has been instrumental in the development of recent image restoration theory. This study shows how Benoit’s theory can be utilized to develop a research experiment involving human-participation. Subjects were presented with fourteen common apologia tactics and asked to rank them in order of preference. The purpose of the study was to demystify some of the questions surrounding public reaction to image restoration efforts.

Introduction
On May 27, 2000, Claudia Kirschchoch disappeared from the beach while vacationing. Except for a blue-and-white striped bikini and a pair of sunglasses, all of the 29-year old’s personal items remained in her hotel room. She left behind her plane ticket, passport, camera and cash.

If the scenario had been slightly different, this missing persons case would probably have been investigated with only half-hearted interest. Certainly it would not have warranted the international media attention it has received, but Claudia Kirschchoch was not the average tourist. She was an experienced, well-respected editor for Frommer’s travel guides. And the beach she disappeared from was not an ordinary retreat. It was part of Jamaica’s billion-dollar-a-year tourist industry: the Sandals Resort at Negril.

When an esteemed editor for one of the United States’ foremost travel guide publishers vanishes while vacationing at a prominent resort facility, the corporation’s management can safely anticipate an image crisis. This is precisely the expectation Sandals’ public relations spokesman, Leo Lambert, had. However, rather than express concern for and sympathy to the family of the missing woman, Mr. Lambert attempted to remove Sandals from the configuration by suggesting that Ms. Kirschchoch had been carefree and reckless. He cited several sources that claimed Claudia had smoked marijuana and skinny-dipped in the days preceding her
disappearance. His accusations suggested that Claudia Kirschhoch put herself in harm's way.

Shortly after Mr. Lambert's misguided approach to image restoration, he was removed as spokesman for the case. Sandals owner Gordon Stewart apologized to Ms. Kirschhoch's family. He loaned his private helicopter for assistance in the search and provided free accommodations in Jamaica for Claudia's parents as the ordeal continued. Recently, Mr. Gordon added $25,000 to the reward for information about Claudia Kirschhoch's disappearance.

**Background**

Any time an organization perceives damage has occurred to its image, *apologia* is usually forthcoming. Apologia can be defined as "a response to a social legitimization crisis in which an organization seeks to justify its behavior by presenting a compelling, counter account of its actions" (Hearit, 1995). Hence, apologia is not necessarily a public apology, but rather a self-defense by the organization against an action that has already occurred.

However, organizations are not the only ones that deal with social legitimacy. Celebrities, athletes and politicians have images to preserve as well. As damage control expert William I. Benoit explains, "image is the perception of a person (or organization) held by the audience, shaped by the words and actions of that person, as well as by the discourse and behavior of other relevant actors." So, image is our public face. Apologia is similar to covering our face during a fistfight to avoid being punched.

Under the classification of apologia, Benoit has developed a theory of *image restoration*. He explains that several approaches are utilized by organizations in restoring their former image. These strategies will be discussed in the next section, but it is important to note that Benoit's theory has been utilized as the framework for developing this study.

When a person or organization publicly "justifies" a past action, apologia is taking place. Further examination of this topic is necessary for several reasons. First, in an effort to determine a pattern of tactics commonly used in apologia, damage control experts have analyzed the content of many speeches and other image restoration efforts. However, up to this point, no human-participation research has been conducted to examine statistically the image restoration approaches and determine which tactics may be more effective.

Second, as damage control expert Lisa Tyler points out, "Crisis communication theory needs to develop a more sophisticated understanding of both the kinds of crises corporations face and the
communication options available (or unavailable) to companies in crisis. Specifically, crisis communication practitioners and scholars need to ask what happens when a company is ethically and legally implicated in its own disaster” (1997).

For these reasons and others, a survey study was conducted in order to determine which image restoration tactics are the most effective and if these tactics are still appropriate when a corporation is responsible for its own crisis.

Literature Review

Apologia

Apologia is possibly the “most enduring of rhetorical genres” (Ware & Linkugel, 1973). The concept of addressing and admitting guilt dates back to ancient Greece where a person was formally accused of a crime or other type of scandal. The apologist then “composed and delivered a speech of self-defense in the presence of his accusers and the voting body of the General Assembly” (Downey, 1993). University of California, Long Beach researcher, Sharon D. Downey, suggests that, historically, apologia has fulfilled a personal function. During the classical period, apologia functioned as a form of self-exoneration. In medieval times, when preordained destiny was common belief, the act of apologia functioned as self-absolution. Later, the upheaval in Europe brought about by the various revolutions during the 18th and 19th centuries caused apologia to become a form of self-sacrifice. The message that the martyr hoped to convey was “directing the responsibilities and commitment of others in the future.” Finally, Downey characterizes contemporary apologia before 1960 as self-service. She notes that MacArthur’s “Old Soldiers Never Die” speech is a veiled attempt to show that one’s accusers can no longer be easily defined.

However, in the past few decades several forces have combined to shape a new form of apologia. First, there has been a growing distrust of the American government and bureaucracy compounded by Richard Nixon and the Watergate affair. Second, there is a “limited knowledge” of leadership in America. And, finally, the media’s quest for tales of “scandal and tragedy” continues (Downey, 1993).

J. Michael Sproule asserts that 20th century rhetorical discourse increasingly comes from an institutional source rather than an individual. Because of this, the direction of apologia is changing. He further argues that “much of the effort to understand corporate apologia, however, is merely a variation of the established individualist-centered approach that
extends that model to the corporate arena rather than one that views corporate apologia as a distant form of discourse” (Sproule, 1998).

**Image Restoration**

The most significant research information for this study comes from William L. Benoit, who summarizes the history of apologia so the reader can better understand how he came to his conclusions. According to Benoit, Baskerville provided one of the earliest critiques of defensive discourse in 1952. This was followed by Jackson’s analysis of Clarence Darrow’s self-defense against charges of bribing a jury. However, it was Rosenberg in 1968 who first compared and contrasted speeches given by Presidents Nixon and Truman and theorized that there may be standard measures taken in apologetic discourse.

In 1973, Ware and Linkugel first proposed the theory of apologia. They identified four common practices of self-defense (cited in Benoit, 1995). Apologia speeches use either denial or bolstering, coupled with differentiation or transcendence. Since Ware and Linkugel’s establishment of the apologia theory, it is the most popular approach for critiquing self-defense discourse.

After extensive research and several notable case studies, William Benoit published his theory of image restoration in 1995. This theory is the most appropriate to use for this study, mainly because it is the most comprehensive, drawing on many of the theories mentioned previously. Benoit is also considered an expert among his peers and is by far the most knowledgeable academic in the field of damage control.

**Common Approaches to Apologia**

In defining his theory, Benoit categorizes five common approaches to apologia: denial, evading responsibility, reducing offensiveness, corrective actions, and mortification. Several of these approaches have subcategories. Denial is simply denying that an act occurred. This is often used initially, but it becomes antiquated when it becomes obvious that the act did occur. Another, often more preferable approach, is scapegoating. “Yes, the act occurred, but I didn’t do it.” Within the evading responsibility category, there are several approaches. Scapegoating implies, “Yes, I committed the act, but only in response to a much worse act.” Deceitability suggests, “Yes, I committed the act, but had little control over the situation.” Another approach within evasion is proposing the act was an accident. Finally, the apologist may attempt to restore image by claiming the act was done with good intentions since it is not fitting to hold someone responsible for a bad thing that occurred from good intentions.
In reducing offensiveness, the rhetor attempts to show that the act was not nearly as damaging as it seems. This can be done in several ways. First, bolstering is an attempt to spotlight past deeds that diminish the recent act. The speaker points out positive actions that they have previously taken. A second option is minimization, which is simply an attempt to persuade the audience to believe that the act is not as offensive as perceived. The speaker may attempt to engage in differentiation. Here, the speaker claims, “You believe I did this act, but really I did this much less offensive act.” A fourth possibility is transcendence, which is the effort to place the act in a more favorable light. Another approach is for the apologist to attack the accusers. If the source’s credibility can be damaged, then the rhetor will appear more favorable. And finally, the sixth option is compensation. The speaker offers to reimburse any damages that may have been caused as a result of the act.

Another approach to image restoration is corrective action. This is probably the most favorable approach because it shows a willingness to correct the act and prevent similar acts in the future. Finally, mortification is the most common and humbling approach. Quite simply, the rhetor admits guilt and begs forgiveness.

Analyses of Image Restoration Attempts

In addition to Benoit’s primary text, several of his case studies from scholarly journals were reviewed. These articles provided insight into applying Benoit’s theory to relevant restoration attempts. In The Tonya Harding Controversy: An Analysis of Image Restoration Strategies, (1994) Benoit suggests that while bolstering, denial, and attacking the accusers are usually appropriate image restoration strategies, Tonya Harding was not effective in employing them. During her interview with Connie Chung, she futilely attempted to portray herself in a manner that was inconsistent with the audience’s perception of her. In addition, she appeared dishonest, which undermined her credibility extremely. Benoit asserts that Harding’s image restoration strategy was unsuccessful.

In another journal article, Hugh Grant’s Image Restoration Discourse: An Actor Apologizes, (1997) Benoit asserts that Grant’s image restoration strategies after his arrest for lewd behavior with a prostitute were highly successful. Benoit suggests that this may be in part to Grant’s mortification and his sincere “expressions of concern for the welfare of his girlfriend,” Elizabeth Hurley.

However, there are several key differences between an entertainer’s image restoration tactics and those of a politician or corporation. Namely, members of a political party or corporation are, by nature, prone to attacks
by an opponent. Hugh Grant did not have to worry that Brad Pitt or Tom Cruise would hold press conferences to further vilify his reputation (Benoit, 1995). In addition, people’s lives are often in danger if a politician or corporation makes a mistake, whereas an actor has little impact on public safety. Finally, corporations are highly susceptible to lawsuits if they employ mortification and admit guilt.

A final article written by Benoit, *Dow Corning’s Image Repair Strategies in the Breast Implant Crisis* (1996) was examined. As with Tonya Harding’s strategy, Benoit finds Dow Corning’s image restoration unsuccessful. He explains that the corporation’s denial of the hazards of silicone breast implants and the evading of responsibility by Dow Corning led to continued attacks on the organization and a growing public distrust. Only when Dow Corning accepted responsibility and offered compensation did the attacks subside and the corporation’s image begin to heal.

As with Benoit, other scholars have analyzed particular events where apologia was employed. Several journal articles were reviewed and the findings are discussed. While most of these scholars refer to Benoit, some extend his theory and include hypotheses of their own. Keith Michael Hearit (1995) contends that corporate apologia warrants a “distinct line of research” to distinguish it from individual image restoration efforts. Hearit has examined the self-defense discourse of organizations involved in crisis, such as Exxon and Domino’s Pizza. He explains that “corporations have rhetorical resources such as individual/group dissociations that are unavailable to individuals; their very corporateness allows them to...scapegoat themselves.” In other words, corporations must maintain legitimacy in order to compete and survive in the international market. Corporations must deliver a product that is financially viable in order to satisfy their monetary backers, including stockholders and suppliers. In addition, corporations must adhere to strict governing laws that regulate the actions of the corporation. But, these levels of legitimacy are not the only criteria necessary for a corporation to survive. As Hearit explains, “there is need for an additional form of sanction, a community or social sanction...This dimension signifies that a corporation’s actions must be ethically defensible; that is, its acts must demonstrate responsibility, create trust, and be legal.”

On September 29, 1982, 12-year-old Mary Kellerman died of cyanide poisoning after consuming two Extra-Strength Tylenol capsules that her father had given her to alleviate her headache. The Tylenol tampering incident was the most publicized news event since the assassination of President Kennedy in 1963. Before the end of the week, seven people in
the Chicago area were dead after ingesting the tainted capsules, and Tylenol makers, Johnson & Johnson, had a major headache on their hands. Consumers disclosed that most "would never take Tylenol again" and fellow corporate marketers called for Johnson & Johnson to throw in the towel (Video Publishing House, 1986).

Instead, the corporation did something extremely unusual. It chose to recall all Tylenol products nationwide, and Johnson & Johnson Chairman Charles Burke went on every news program available to alleviate the public's fear. He informed consumers that Johnson & Johnson was also a "victim" in the incident and that it could have happened to any manufacturer. Burke labeled it an "industry-wide problem," and addressed concerns about future tampering.

Within one year, Tylenol was back on the market with new tamper-proof packaging. By 1986, just four years later, Johnson & Johnson had regained its share of the pain reliever market.

While Johnson & Johnson set precedence in corporate apologia, stockholder interests often sideline community concerns. For example, environmentally responsible waste elimination is usually much more expensive than standard dumping. For this reason, "corporations that seek social legitimacy frequently face a difficult choice, for they cannot always be accountable to both managerial and social interests" (Hearit, 1995).

On March 24, 1989, the Exxon Valdez ran aground on Prince William Sound, Alaska. The oil tanker spilled more than 11 million of the 50 million gallons of crude oil on board. The spill was the largest in U.S. history and the fourth largest ever. That same day, a press statement was released in which Exxon expressed remorse and assumed responsibility for clean up. Still, the public was outraged. The news footage of spoiled beaches and dying wildlife was horrific. Dennis Kelso, a spokesperson for the Commission of the Alaska Department of Environmental Conservation, criticized Exxon saying, "the initial response was inadequate and didn't match the planned, outlined response measures to be taken in a spill." Clifton Curtis, executive director for the Oceanic Society, claimed the petroleum hydrocarbons in the Sound would act as "time-release capsules" causing damage for "months and even years" (Hearit, 1995).

Exxon retaliated, pointing fingers at the Coast Guard, which had discontinued tracking tankers through the Sound and replaced more powerful radar with a less expensive, smaller version. Exxon implicated the State of Alaska, which found an oil spill the size of Valdez acceptable as long as it only happened "once every 241 years" (Hearit, 1995). Finally, Exxon betrayed its own employee when it scapegoated Captain Hazelwood
who, Exxon had been long aware, had a drinking problem.

Still, public anger focused on Exxon. Three weeks after the spill, Exxon finally addressed the public's concerns by taking out a full-page advertisement in major newspapers entitled *An Open Letter to the Public*. Ultimately, it admitted, "the charge against Exxon was that its incompetence violated the public value of respect for the environment." For many, this apologia tactic remained "too little, too late." As damage control expert Lisa Tyler stated, the "handling of the Tylenol poisonings is generally perceived as the model for effective crisis communication. Exxon's handling of the Valdez oil spill is generally perceived as an example of what not to do in a crisis."

Keith Michael Hearn also examined charges against Domino's Pizza that its delivery policy, "thirty minutes or less," was the root cause of a series of fatal accidents involving its teenage delivery drivers. On June 3, 1989, 17-year old delivery driver Jesse Colson died after his vehicle slid off a rain-soaked highway, striking a power pole. Media across the country quickly leapt at the story because it had public appeal. There was a clear villain — Domino's Pizza — and an innocent victim. Domino's employed an effective apologia tactic. The company went right to the heart of its target audience. By affixing an apologia entitled "Safety First" to the top of its pizza boxes, "the company conveyed its message directly to the one segment of the public that mattered most, its patrons, without calling further attention to the issue as would have occurred had the company placed an advertisement in a mass mediated forum" (1995). Hearn's conclusion echoes Lisa Tyler's concern that corporate apology or mortification, may imply legal liability. Tyler suggests that, like Domino's targeting of its specific consumers, corporations employ an equivocation or strategic ambiguity tactic when openness and candor are not an appropriate choice.

The book *Communicating When Your Company is Under Siege: Surviving Public Crisis* (1999), gives several examples of how corporate crisis is best handled. In it, Marion Pindorf discusses a menagerie of image restoration efforts from Tylenol to Lee Iacocca's successful image restoration plan for the Chrysler Corporation.

**An Empirical Study**

As previously mentioned, a thorough examination of literature found no human-participation studies in apologia and image restoration efforts. However, survey research in this area is long overdue. By conducting this research, the study of apologia can expand beyond the analysis of past events and incorporate the "what if?"
Damage control is not something for which most companies plan. In fact, many hope they will never have to employ a damage control expert. However, hiding secrets from the American public is a thing of the past. The truth will eventually come out. The more quickly an organization employs appropriate apology tactics, the sooner its image will be repaired. Respondent research is the first step in determining what the public expects and in training corporate public relations staff accordingly.

**Synopsis**

Research subjects were asked to participate in an undergraduate research study. Participants were told that a video would be shown and they would need to complete a brief survey. After the video presentation, the research group was asked to rank segments of the video as either very effective, somewhat effective, somewhat ineffective, or very ineffective. The participants were further directed to choose the most effective and least effective efforts of all of the video clips shown. The entire process took less than twenty minutes.

**The Research Video**

A Beta quality video was produced with the assistance of a professional film studio. The video contained two major sections: a newscast and image restoration attempts. The video newscast ran approximately one minute in length. It announced that the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) had reprimanded Gabriel Pharmaceutical, a major manufacturer of over-the-counter medications, for illegally including an unauthorized drug in its products. The drug could potentially produce birth defects in unborn babies if the mother ingested the product while she was pregnant. The second portion of the video displayed the president of Gabriel Pharmaceutical addressing the public in a variety of segments utilizing the fourteen image restoration tactics associated with Benoit's theory. Each video clip was 20- to 30-seconds long.

**Methods**

Eighty-five subjects participated in the study. All are employed by the State of California and work in the Natural Resources Building in downtown Sacramento. Although all of the subjects work for a common entity, there was great diversity amongst the group. Participants’ jobs ranged from entry-level to senior management in public service. Based on the criteria for these employment categories, it can be assumed that education level ranged from not finishing high school to holding an advanced degree, although this demographic question was not posed.
Two specific demographic questions were presented: age and gender. Participants ranged in age from early 20s to late 50s. Women comprised nearly 65 percent of the participants.

**Instrumentation and Procedure**

A written questionnaire was distributed detailing demographic information for age and gender. Next, participants were asked to rank components within the fourteen common models of image restoration using a Liechert-type scale. A score of 4 indicated very effective, 3 indicated somewhat effective, 2 indicated somewhat ineffective and 1 indicated very ineffective. In addition, participants were asked to rank the model groups overall to reflect which tactic was most effective and which was least effective.

From the beginning, participants were aware that the newscast and ensuing apologia attempts were fictional. However, in order to better preserve the study, the participants did not receive surveys that labeled the image restoration efforts by name (i.e., attaching the accusers, mortification). Rather, only numbers identified each of the fourteen scenarios so that the subjects were not prejudiced by the theoretical terms.

**Sampling Method**

Eighty-five surveys were distributed. One survey was discarded because the participant ranked each of the fourteen apologia efforts as very effective. In an effort to reduce the margin of error, this questionnaire was not included in the results. Using this volunteer sampling is appropriate for this type of study in that most of the subjects would be considered part of the target audience in a corporate image restoration effort. The participants were all above the age of majority and potential consumers of pharmaceutical products. The non-random sample group was probably a valid representation of consumers in Northern California.

**Data Analysis**

Eighty-four respondents’ surveys were utilized. All data was compiled in a frequency distribution table. To achieve a raw score for individual scenarios, each image restoration attempt was totaled using scores correlated to the Likert-type score. The mode of each video clip was then determined. For this study, the mode is particularly useful because it determines the most frequent score assigned to each particular scenario. In this manner, the mode was utilized to assign the individual video clips to one of the four effectiveness categories. Next, the raw scores
labeled effective.

- Corrective Action: Effective (Raw Score: 240)
- Compensation: Effective (Raw Score: 236)
- Denial: Effective (Raw Score: 170)
- Transcendence: Effective (Raw Score: 161)
- Bolstering: Effective (Raw Score: 157)
- Differentiation: Effective (Raw Score: 151)
- Provocation: Effective (Raw Score: 141)
- Good Intentions: Ineffective (Raw Score: 131)
- Accident: Ineffective (Raw Score: 126)
- Minimization: Ineffective (Raw Score: 126)
- Mortification: Ineffective (Raw Score: 119)
- Scapegoating: Ineffective (Raw Score: 117)
- Attacking the Accusers: Ineffective (Raw Score: 108)
- Defeasibility: Ineffective (Raw Score: 94)

Direct Responses

The final section of the survey consisted of two opinion questions. Subjects were asked to determine the most effective and least effective of the fourteen image restoration efforts. The results were as follows:

Most Effective Restoration Efforts

- Corrective Action – 29 responses
- Compensation – 29 responses
- Differentiation – 7 responses
- Mortification – 7 responses
- Denial – 3 responses
- Bolstering – 2 responses
- Transcendence – 2 responses
- Good Intentions – 2 responses
- Attacking the Accusers – 2 responses
- Accident – 1 response

Note: Scapegoating, provocation, minimization, and defeasibility were not considered most effective by any member of the survey group.

Least Effective Restoration Efforts:

- Defeasibility – 27 responses
- Attacking the Accusers – 24 responses
- Mortification – 7 responses
- Scapegoating – 7 responses
- Provocation – 3 responses
- Transcendence – 3 responses
• Good Intentions – 3 responses
• Differentiation – 2 responses
• Accident – 2 responses
• Bolstering – 2 responses
• Minimization – 2 responses
• Compensation – 1 response
• Denial – 1 response

Note: Corrective action was not labeled least effective by any member of the survey group.

Discussion of Results

Two distinct image restoration attempts are prominent at each end of the scale. For the given scenario, survey participants largely associated corrective action and compensation as the most effective and attacking the accusers and defeasibility as the least effective apology efforts. All three methods of analysis utilized in this study concur to indicate that these four apology attempts are either very effective or very ineffective, respectively.

Although it might be expected that attacking the accusers would be labeled ineffective in the scenario, defeasibility seems less obviously ineffective. However, not only was it consistently categorized as ineffective, in all three methods of analysis defeasibility received the lowest total score making it the most ineffective image restoration effort. It appears that this particular audience would rather the corporation not accept responsibility than use a poor excuse.

By far the most compelling information revealed in this study is the slight favoritism by the research group toward corrective action rather than compensation as the most effective image restoration attempt. Although both efforts received the same score for effectiveness in the opinion questions posed to the audience, corrective action was not categorized as least effective by any participant, but compensation was.

The mode revealed that 40 respondents found corrective action somewhat effective, while only 32 respondents labeled compensation the same. The establishment of a median score proved corrective action 104 points above the median, whereas compensation was slightly lower at 100 points. Finally, the corresponding percentages assigned to the Likert scale answers show that 74 percent of the participants found corrective action effective, while only 68 percent labeled compensation effective.

From a financial perspective, this is attractive information for corporations that might find themselves in a recall situation. While corrective action often results in some form of compensation, this group of consumers is willing to admit that their pocketbooks are less important than their
personal safety. The majority of the respondents seemed willing to forego reimbursement in exchange for future peace of mind.

**Limitations of the Study**

Conducting a human-participant study on a topic that is normally analyzed through content examination brings about obvious limitations. First, the participants were shown a video of all fourteen common apology tactics in one session. During actual damage control recourse, organizations decide on an apology approach and utilize it to the full extent. Only if the tactic becomes antiquated because of new information regarding the incident, or if the audience is not persuaded, would an additional strategy be brought into play. In some cases, two or three tactics may be combined (i.e., mortification and corrective action), but efforts are generally limited to the fewest number of strategies possible.

In this study's scenario, the subjects were able to compare the different strategies side-by-side. Although this certainly made the study possible, it also threatens the validity of the study. Participants may have discounted a strategy and labeled it very ineffective compared to the others, but would have considered it very effective had only that clip been shown.

Second, the subjects were aware that they were participating in a research experiment. As the Hawthorne study confirmed, this could possibly skew the results in that participants will "behave differently than they do when they are not being observed" (cited in Frey, Botan & Kreps, 2000). Subjects may anticipate a proper response and mark that as more effective than one they perceive as less honest or accommodating. However, content analysis has shown that denial or defeasibility can be effective apology strategies if the audience is unaware of the tactic.

Finally, there were limitations to the text of the scenario. Obviously, certain organizational infractions call for a particular type of apology response. It was very difficult to develop responses for each of the fourteen tactics given just one scenario. Particular strategies would be more effective for this scenario than others. However, those strategies would be ineffective given another situation. The particular scenario used in this study was not representative of all public apology efforts. Yet, this study is a good foundation for further statistical study of image restoration strategies.

**Further Discussion**

This study was conducted to determine the effectiveness of apology tactics from the consumer's viewpoint. Of course, the general public is
often the target audience in most image restoration efforts. For corporations the general public is labeled "consumer;" for politicians the audience is their "constituents;" and, for media and sports personalities, their "fans." While this study applied a corporate setting, it can be considered representative of other organizations and individuals, as well.

A subsequent study might show the video and distribute the corresponding questionnaire to corporate managers and public relations staff. It seems that the corporate perception of what the consumer wants is often very different from the consumer's expectations. Further study into this area might develop a noteworthy training tool providing corporations with information on customer requirements in apology efforts.
References


